

1979

A Comparison Study of Media Skills Guides for the Elementary Grades

Barbara J. Steen
University of Northern Iowa

Let us know how access to this document benefits you

Copyright ©1979 Barbara J. Steen

Follow this and additional works at: <https://scholarworks.uni.edu/grp>

Recommended Citation

Steen, Barbara J., "A Comparison Study of Media Skills Guides for the Elementary Grades" (1979).
Graduate Research Papers. 4013.

<https://scholarworks.uni.edu/grp/4013>

This Open Access Graduate Research Paper is brought to you for free and open access by the Student Work at UNI ScholarWorks. It has been accepted for inclusion in Graduate Research Papers by an authorized administrator of UNI ScholarWorks. For more information, please contact scholarworks@uni.edu.

Offensive Materials Statement: Materials located in UNI ScholarWorks come from a broad range of sources and time periods. Some of these materials may contain offensive stereotypes, ideas, visuals, or language.

A Comparison Study of Media Skills Guides for the Elementary Grades

Find Additional Related Research in UNI ScholarWorks

To find related research in UNI ScholarWorks, go to the collection of [School Library Studies Graduate Research Papers](#) written by students in the [Division of School Library Studies](#), Department of Curriculum and Instruction, College of Education, at the University of Northern Iowa.

Abstract

Five published guides for elementary media skills instruction were selected and compared for general learning skills, instruction in topical areas unique to the media center, and capacity for integrating media skills into the elementary school curriculum. The hypotheses checked the grade levels where general learning skills and topical areas were introduced, taught, or reviewed. The extent of media skills instruction and exposure to nonprint materials and activities was also examined for primary and intermediate grades. Written statements of philosophy were examined for evidence of the integration concept.

The hypothesis concerning general learning skills was rejected because an inadequate number of guides contained general learning skills as part of their skills descriptions. Each of the three hypotheses concerning topical areas unique to the media center was accepted, indicating that the guides provided an adequate percentage of initial instruction in these areas. The hypothesis dealing with instruction of nonprint materials and creative activities was rejected because an inadequate number of guides provided instruction in both areas for primary and intermediate grades. Three of the five guides contained philosophy in support of an integrated approach to teaching media skills, thus allowing the hypothesis on integration to be accepted.

The guides were varied in format and in their method of listing or describing skills introduced or taught. Some were difficult to record on the forms designed for this study. Media specialists utilizing any of these guides as a model for their own building programs will need to adapt them to fit the needs of their students, faculty, and facility.

A Comparison Study
of Media Skills Guides
for the Elementary Grades

A Research Paper
Presented to the
Faculty of the Library Science Department

In partical Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Arts

Barbara J. Steen

July 9, 1979

Read and approved by

Mary Lou Mc Grew

Leah Hiland

Accepted by Department

Elizabeth Martin

Date

July 13, 1979

Abstract

Five published guides for elementary media skills instruction were selected and compared for general learning skills, instruction in topical areas unique to the media center, and capacity for integrating media skills into the elementary school curriculum. The hypotheses checked the grade levels where general learning skills and topical areas were introduced, taught, or reviewed. The extent of media skills instruction and exposure to nonprint materials and activities was also examined for primary and intermediate grades. Written statements of philosophy were examined for evidence of the integration concept.

The hypothesis concerning general learning skills was rejected because an inadequate number of guides contained general learning skills as part of their skills descriptions. Each of the three hypotheses concerning topical areas unique to the media center was accepted, indicating that the guides provided an adequate percentage of initial instruction in these areas. The hypothesis dealing with instruction of nonprint materials and creative activities was rejected because an inadequate number of guides provided instruction in both areas for primary and intermediate grades. Three of the five guides contained philosophy in support of an integrated approach to teaching media skills, thus allowing the hypothesis on integration to be accepted.

The guides were varied in format and in their method of listing or describing skills introduced or taught. Some were difficult to record on the forms designed for this study. Media specialists utilizing any of these guides as a model for their own building programs will need to adapt them to fit the needs of their students, faculty, and facility.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
LIST OF TABLES	ii
Chapter	
1. INTRODUCTION	1
2. REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE	8
3. METHODOLOGY	24
4. ANALYSIS OF DATA	34
5. SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS	43
APPENDIXES	
A. COMPARISON FORMS; GENERAL LEARNING SKILLS AND TOPICAL SKILLS TABULATED FOR EACH GUIDE	48
B. COMPARISON FORM; SUMMARY OF TOPICAL SKILLS BY PRIMARY AND INTERMEDIATE GRADES	54
C. COMPARISON FORMS; EVIDENCE OF INTEGRATED APPROACH	56
BIBLIOGRAPHY	62
FIVE GUIDES CHOSEN FOR COMPARISON	64

LIST OF TABLES

Table		Page
1.	General Learning Skills in Guides	34
2.	Topical Areas in Guides	35
3.	Occurrences of Initial Instruction in Topical Areas 1-11	37
4.	Occurrences of Initial Instruction in Topical Areas 12 and 13	39

Chapter 1

INTRODUCTION

As more elementary schools work toward developing media centers from their libraries, the media specialists in such buildings are faced with the task of building a complete media program. Ideally, the program should be related to all areas of the building's curriculum, encouraging utilization of many media formats toward the achievement of course and learning objectives.

At the elementary level, students possess a natural enthusiasm to work and to learn independently. They are usually eager participants in activities planned by both the teacher and the media specialist that correlate with their classroom studies, but they also enjoy using resources of the media center on their own.

Media specialists have designed a wide variety of programs of media skills instruction centered around the general objective of producing a student who is an independent and effective user of media.¹ Media skills are an integral part of many major educational goals and are essential to the accomplishment of others.²

¹Thomas H. Walker, Teaching Media Skills (Littleton, Colorado: Libraries Unlimited, Inc., 1977), p. 25.

²Ibid., p. 26.

Media skills can be defined as the group of student skills related to the gathering and utilization of information which in past educational usage was designated by such terms as "research skills", "study skills", and "library skills". Use of the term "media skills" recognizes the use of nonprint sources and also corresponds with the change in terminology from library to media center and from instructional materials to instructional media.³

Media skills programs created for the elementary level appear to be similar with respect to grade-level distribution and topical areas presented. They may differ in respect to depth of content, types of media included in instruction, methods of instruction, and detail of the program itself. Many programs have been written with the needs of one particular elementary school situation in mind.

However, questions may emerge concerning the variances of these published guides from media specialists who wish to use them. Are the guides designed to be used only for instruction in the media center? Do they suggest any integration of media skills with components of the curriculum? Are objectives and activities written that are current and appropriate for students in the elementary school?

The purpose of the writer in this research project was to select five published guides for elementary skills instruction and to compare their content using three guiding questions, as follows:

Do recently published media skills guides provide activities satisfying the general objectives of learning?

Do these media skills guides provide activities in topical areas unique to the media center?

³Ibid., p. 11.

At what grade level and what level of instruction (introduced, taught, reviewed) do these media skills guides provide activities, with respect to the elementary school?

Thomas Walker grouped learning skills objectives in the following manner:

1. The ability to identify and locate materials
2. The ability to select one media item over another
3. The ability to utilize, comprehend, and apply information derived from media formats
4. The ability to create, produce, or present media materials⁴

Walker's list provided a basis for this writer to establish a set of learning skills objectives for comparison. Each specific skill in the four general objectives above was listed as a separate category, making a total of nine categories for the first step in comparison.

The topical areas to be considered which are unique to the media center are:

1. Orientation to the media center
2. Care of materials
3. Location of media center materials
4. Parts of a book
5. The card catalog
6. Classification; the Dewey Decimal System
7. Arrangement of fiction and nonfiction
8. Research skills
9. Use of reference materials

⁴Ibid., p. 25.

10. Magazines
11. Use of Readers' Guide to Periodical Literature
12. Nonprint media and appropriate equipment
13. Creative activities involving local production⁵

These topical areas are defined in the Operational Definitions section of the methodology.

The five skills guides were selected to fit the following criteria:

1. Date of publication is 1970 or later;
2. Skills are distributed by grade levels from kindergarten through sixth grade;
3. General objectives are listed for the grade levels included;
4. Suggested or actual activities are provided to support the general objectives.

Hypotheses

Six hypotheses were formulated for this research project.

1. Each guide chosen will provide learning experiences in six out of nine of the categories listed when tallying grade-placement level in relation to the general objectives of learning as directed toward integration.

2. Each guide chosen will provide learning experiences in nine out of thirteen of the categories listed when tallying grade-placement

⁵Contra Costa County Department of Education, Educational Media Services, Handbook for Elementary Library Media Instruction, revised edition. U.S. Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 125 652, 1975.

level in relation to the topical areas unique to the media center.

3. Among all five guides, 75 percent of the initial instruction in the first four topical areas unique to the media center will be found to occur in the primary grades, or in kindergarten and grades one through three.

4. Among all five guides, 75 percent of the initial instruction in topical areas numbered five through eleven that are unique to the media center will be found to occur in the intermediate grades, or in grades four through six.

5. Instruction for the purpose of introduction, actual teaching, or review in topical areas numbered twelve and thirteen that are unique to the media center will be found to occur in both primary and intermediate grades in four out of five of the guides chosen for comparison.

6. At least three of the five guides chosen for comparison will, through justification contained within, be found to support the philosophy of integrating media skills with components of the elementary school curriculum.

Significance of the Problem

Media specialists are continually seeking suitable materials for skills instruction that are current, fit general learning skills objectives, fit a specific topical need, and blend easily into the established school curriculum.

Because the scope of skills instruction varies from building to building, media specialists may be forced to choose one route to follow; that is, either to work on general learning skills with media center applications, or to concentrate on topics unique to the media center,

without an opportunity to integrate these skills with curriculum. This project's comparison of current skills guides, taking all these areas into consideration, may aid media professionals or school district committees in selecting or utilizing a skills guide or combination of guides that best fit their needs.

Assumptions

Five media skills guides for the elementary grades can be located to fit the guidelines for inclusion as established in the purpose.

Instruction in media skills is an important component in contributing to fulfillment of the general learning objectives established for the elementary school student.

Integration of skills with areas of the curriculum provides an appropriate link between the media center and the classroom.

A media center supplemented by an appropriate skills program is valuable to the elementary school child.

Media skills instruction is equally important to students at the primary and the intermediate levels.

Limitations

The number of skills guides examined was limited to five so that they could be thoroughly compared in the three areas described in the purpose. The skills guides were compared in only the three areas described in the purpose, although other elements were components of particular guides.

Literature was eliminated from review that did not deal with media programs at the elementary level, as were those sources that

summarized media programs organized in other than a skills-type format.

Definitions

Primary grade students are defined for purposes of this research project as those pupils in kindergarten and grades one through three. Intermediate grade students are defined as those pupils in grades four through six. Operational definitions related to the comparison of the skills guides will be given in the methodology.

Chapter 2

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

A search of literature was conducted, emerging with summaries of library and media skills programs published in the last two decades. Additional literature was also sought concerning the isolated and integrated approaches to library and media skills programs, the importance of maintaining elementary school media centers and teaching media skills to students, grade placement of skills, media skills programs in specific elementary schools, and the concepts that such programs emphasize.

Printed materials on the teaching of media skills have gradually materialized with the development of elementary school media centers during the twentieth century. During the period from 1900 to 1950, several books were published for the elementary librarian. Some of these were of a professional level in design, giving outlines or ideas of what to teach. Others were designed for direct use with children. Content usually included book selection, book circulation, and appreciation of literature. Alphabetizing or simple dictionary work were the only skills suggested for instruction. Such materials make it obvious that educators had not realized the importance or potential of the elementary school library.⁶ However, by the 1950's, the need for improved library

⁶Daphne Jeanne McLean, "A Study of the Necessity of Library Skills Instruction in the Primary Grades" (Master of Arts thesis, California State University, 1972), p. 6.

facilities and materials was recognized by educators. They also sought full-time librarians if they were available.

The publication of Standards for School Library Programs by the American Library Association in 1960 presented guidelines for functional school library programs in both qualitative and quantitative standards. Also, with the implementation of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965, school libraries developed much more rapidly and were able to take initial steps toward achievement of the 1960 Standards.⁷

These two events influenced the development of elementary school libraries and resulting programs, as the 1960-1965 time period marked the publication date for several books that were designed to teach library skills to elementary students. Such books included The Children's Book on How to Use Books and Libraries by Carolyn Mott and Leo Baisden, A Guidebook for Teaching Library Skills, a five-volume set by Margaret V. Beck and Vera M. Pace, and The Elementary School Library in Action, by Lora Palovic and Elizabeth Goodman.

A comparison of two of these books in relation to their philosophies revealed some interesting points. The set by Beck and Pace does not advocate either integration or isolation, but the authors state that the teaching of skills should occur when the need arises from a student's interest or from a classroom assignment:

The sections of the library may be introduced to individuals at any grade level when they show an interest in or a need for information in books other than those found in the picture book collection.... The use of the card catalog should be started at any time when a child shows a need for such instruction.... The foundations for using the reference section are begun as early

⁷Richard W. Hostrop, Education Inside the Library Media Center (Hamden, Connecticut: Linnet Books, 1973), p. 55.

as kindergarten... By instructing small groups in the use of reference books at a time when they have a real desire to learn how to use them is the best possible motivation.⁸

The philosophy of the guide by Palovic and Goodman appears to be one of isolation, stating that "the novice will need to exercise care to avoid becoming enmeshed in subject material whose proper place is the classroom. She must bear in mind that her focus is application only of library skills to any given subject."⁹ Another statement emphasizes application, but not integration: "...Concentrated application of skills learned in the fall comes in the spring through reference assignments."¹⁰ Terms such as "drill", "weekly lesson", and "lectures" occur frequently enough to make one think that the lessons are closely structured around isolated library skills.

In the 1970's, additional books on elementary media centers were published, but most included only a brief section on skill development as a part of the total media center program responsibilities. Included in this group are Developing A Successful Elementary School Media Center by Lillian Glogau and others, and Pathfinder: An Operational Guide for the School Librarian, by Patricia Freeman.

Examination of these two sources for evidence of their philosophies in teaching library and media skills revealed differences in opinion concerning the concept of integration. Glogau states that

⁸Margaret V. Beck and Vera M. Pace, A Guidebook for Teaching Library Skills (Minneapolis: T.S. Denison and Company, Inc., 1967), p. 7.

⁹Lora Palovic and Elizabeth Goodman, The Elementary School Library in Action (New York: Prentice-Hall Publishers, Inc., 1968), p. x.

¹⁰Ibid., p. 195.

"strategies must be employed to involve the teaching staff in continued utilization of the media center for it to become an integral part of the regular school program."¹¹ She also stated that the goal of the media center is "to broaden, enrich, and titillate the learning experiences of each child; to make it a natural part of the total school environment."¹² Glogau also feels that "listening, watching and reading skills ... are an ongoing process. The skills have a sequential order. Children proceed from the mastery of the most simple to the most complicated. These skills are as indigenous to the classroom curriculum as they are to the media center curriculum."¹³

The guide by Freeman emphasizes having teachers present lessons on library-use instruction. A list of suggestions is given for "implementing the curriculum." The basic framework for integrating media skills into the curriculum is present in the guide by Freeman, but is not outlined through a skills teaching plan.

Also in the 1970's, increasing numbers of educational producers and publishers marketed multimedia kits to teach library and media skills to all ages. This increase in the creation of media skills learning packages brought the need to know just what was available. In 1975, a bibliography of library and media skills instructional resources was compiled by Margret Iadanza. Using a letter of inquiry approach sent to all known educational producers, publishers, and distributors, she

¹¹Lillian Glogau, Edmund Krause, and Miriam Wexler, Developing a Successful Elementary School Media Center (West Nyack, New York: Parker Publishing Co., Inc., 1972), p. 79.

¹²Ibid.

¹³Ibid., p. 39.

obtained bibliographic data for 368 items of varied format used to teach library and media skills. Of these, 48 were designed to be used specifically in the elementary grades.¹⁴ However, such commercial publications have been found to have serious weaknesses, and many media specialists use such publications as a model to develop their own guides and materials for skills instruction.

Several studies emphasize the importance of having a media center available for elementary students to use, whether or not a skills program is included. Mary Gaver, in her study on elementary media centers, stated that "from 1963 to 1967, one of the most significant changes in educational thinking was the acceptance of the media concept, or, in other words, the school library incorporating and servicing children's needs with media in many forms."¹⁵ Also, in 1968, the Knapp School Libraries Project noted this change, stating that "the philosophy of the school library as a center for all instructional materials has won general acceptance."¹⁶

Additional justification for the existence of elementary school media centers emerges in two doctoral dissertations. In the first, tests were administered to students at the fourth and sixth grade levels to determine whether the quality of learning is strengthened for elementary

¹⁴Margret A. Iadanza, The Development of a Bibliography of Library Skills Instructional Resources. U.S. Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 114 085, 1975.

¹⁵Mary Virginia Gaver, Patterns of Development in Elementary School Libraries Today: A Five Year Report on Emerging Media Centers (3d ed.; Chicago: Encyclopaedia Britannica, Inc., 1969), p. 34.

¹⁶Peggy Sullivan, ed., Realization: The Final Report of the Knapp School Libraries Project (Chicago: American Library Association, 1968), p. 4.

students having access to a centralized library program administered by a media professional. Students in twelve Detroit elementary schools were given the Iowa Tests of Basic Skills and the Library Skills Test. Reading achievement and composite scores from the Iowa Tests of Basic Skills and reference skills scores from the Library Skills Test were noted for comparison. Six of the schools housed centralized libraries; six did not. The findings from testing indicated superior educational gains for the students in schools with a centralized library and a media professional in the areas of reading abilities and reference skills. Ms. Willson also noted in her study that students in the schools without libraries were not supplied with any materials to learn library-related skills.¹⁷

In the second dissertation, James Yarling involved two elementary schools in a three-year test to compare students' understanding and use of library-related skills. The school labeled as the experimental school in the study housed a centralized, well-equipped library. The school used as the control school had no library facilities. Yarling's testing measures included the Special Reading Test, the Library Skills Test, and the Library Acquaintance Test. He found that students in the school with the centralized library performed significantly better on all tests than students without library access. He also found that within the experimental school, fourth grade students in 1965 showed significant improvement in all areas when tested as sixth grade students in 1967. These areas included library skills, arrangement of library materials, and expressing ideas effectively in relation to reading. The 1965 fourth

¹⁷Ella Jean Willson, "Evaluating Urban Centralized Elementary School Libraries," Dissertation Abstracts International, 27:1567-68A, December, 1966.

grade students in the control school showed only slight improvement in the first two areas when tested in 1967.¹⁸

Both of these doctoral studies demonstrated that the elementary students involved benefited from the availability of library resources, and that scores improved when students were tested on skills directly related to the library. However, significant gain was also noted in general educational achievement and in skills related to reading ability. Such outcomes provide additional evidence for the necessity of elementary media centers and their accompanying skills programs.

Daphne McLean, in her thesis dealing with media skills for the primary grades, points out four reasons for offering elementary media skills instruction:

1. The curiosity, interest, and enthusiasm of a younger child can be directly applied to discovery and learning in the media center.

2. Instruction should be offered so that only reinforcement-type instruction of basic skills is necessary in junior and senior high grades, so that media specialists can proceed with more detailed or difficult media skills related to the secondary school curriculum.

3. As more methods of independent study and the inquiry approach are being initiated in the elementary grades, with students expected to proceed on their own, the ability to use materials is essential.

4. Media skills instruction at this level leads to better habits and attitudes toward reading and the use of libraries in the future.¹⁹

¹⁸James Robert Yarling, Sr., "Children's Understandings and Use of Selected Library-Related Skills in Two Elementary Schools, One With and One Without a Centralized Library," Dissertation Abstracts International, 29:3352-53A, April, 1969.

¹⁹McLean, op. cit., p. 16.

Studies have also been conducted to determine if elementary pupils benefit from receiving instruction in media skills. Ms. Gaver, in summarizing research completed on elementary school libraries, noted the following:

Children who have had systematic instruction in library skills closely related to the curriculum and the opportunity to use an organized library collection consistently and continuously score higher on work-study tests and/or on tests of library skills than do children lacking this opportunity.²⁰

Project Impact, completed at Maedgen Elementary School in Lubbock, Texas, supports Ms. Gaver's statement. Tests were conducted to assess the importance of instruction in media center usage. The experimental group received instruction and also had the opportunity to use the media center to obtain materials for both curricular and noncurricular activities. Students in the control group attended a school with limited media center access, and received no skills instruction. Tests given in library skills showed a significant difference in scores, indicating that students with both media center accessibility and media skills instruction have a distinct advantage over those with no such opportunities.²¹ While these results may be anticipated, there are perhaps greater implications for students to possess lifelong library and media skills because they have received this type of exposure and instruction.

Today's primary grade students are prime candidates for media skills instruction in that many have been exposed to such educationally

²⁰Mary Virginia Gaver, "Research on Elementary School Libraries," American Library Association Bulletin, February, 1962, p. 121.

²¹Len Ainsworth, "An Objective Measure of the Impact of a Library Learning Center," School Libraries, Winter, 1969, p. 35.

based programs as preschool instruction and Headstart. They also are more receptive to instruction because of the influence of television and formalized kindergarten training. They enter the primary grades ready and eager to learn about the media center and to use it effectively. Students of this age group are capable of learning about such topics unique to media centers as the parts of a book, arrangement of fiction, the Dewey Decimal System, use of encyclopedias, and the purpose of the card catalog. If these topics are presented to primary students in the proper way, they will be familiar with them when they reach the intermediate grades and are expected to use them.²²

However, many of the earlier published materials on elementary library skills were written for a student audience of fourth grade or older, with respect to vocabulary used and skills presented. Primary grade pupils were ignored.

According to the historical search of skills done by Ms. McLean in her study, the first series of guidebooks to include primary level lessons was the set by Beck and Pace. These books included material on selection, circulation, and appreciation as did the earlier published materials, but also covered such topics as authors, illustrators, fiction and nonfiction differences, and basic elements of the Dewey Decimal System presented at the first, second, and third grade levels.²³ McLean found that the book by Palovic suggested that the card catalog be introduced and simple alphabetizing rules be presented to primary students.²⁴

²²McLean, op. cit., p. 9.

²³Ibid., p. 8.

²⁴Ibid., p. 7.

Another author in addition to Ms. McLean felt that primary grade students are often neglected when consideration is being given to the development of the skills program in the media center. Nancy Pollette emphasizes that introducing research skills at the primary level should not be thought of as an addition to the primary curriculum but rather as a functional application of those skills included in the curriculum.

Simple research and reference skills can be acquired by primary students and should be introduced in a functional situation in the kindergarten program and developed throughout the elementary school years. The skills taught should be those that primary students will use, and should be followed immediately by application by the student,²⁵

Two additional creators of media skills programs were found to agree with this philosophy. Eleanor Ahlers advocates instructing primary grade students, but on an individualized inquiry basis. Each child should learn to select, utilize, and evaluate various types of media appropriate to a specific learning activity.²⁶ The Middleton, Wisconsin public schools begin instruction in most of their media skill categories in the primary grades. Their philosophy states that skills are most efficiently acquired when students need them to gather information for a specific project.²⁷

Testing has been accomplished with primary students in media skills knowledge with some interesting but unfortunate results. A committee in the Mount Vernon, Indiana school district developed a media

²⁵Nancy Pollette, Developing Methods of Inquiry: A Source Book for Elementary Media Personnel (Metuchen, New Jersey: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 1973), p. 93.

²⁶Eleanor E. Ahlers, "Instruction in Library Skills," School Libraries, Spring, 1972, p. 23.

²⁷L.E. Baitinger, "Trying on New Media Skills," Wisconsin Library Bulletin, July, 1977, p. 151.

skills program for kindergarten through eighth grade. In examining commercial skills programs that had been previously used with their primary pupils, the committee members felt that certain skills were taught later through the commercial programs than needed by pupils for classroom-related work. The committee's feelings were confirmed through the school's testing program: students were being tested for knowledge of skills they had not been exposed to, and probably would not be exposed to for at least another year, if use of the commercial skills program was continued. The committee therefore decided to develop their own program in which they could teach skills earlier than what had been recommended commercially.²⁸

Thus it is shown that the primary grade pupil needs exposure to skills at an earlier age than some commercial programs call for. A student may not be capable of complete comprehension, but when interest in a source is shown, an introduction to that source is important in order to fulfill the child's sense of curiosity. Actual teaching of the source can be undertaken when the student is ready to use and apply the source's content to coursework, not to isolated lessons.

Ms. Pollette, when referring to skill development in the intermediate grades, again emphasizes instruction when the skill is needed and can be immediately applied. When intermediate students have experienced a primary level skills program, they should be able to develop the higher-level skills of critical thinking and independent judgment through their

²⁸Elizabeth N. Blackwell, "A Sequence of Library Skills," Hoosier School Libraries, February, 1975, p. 18, cited by Thomas L. Hart, ed., Instruction in School Media Center Use (Chicago: American Library Association, 1978), p. 21.

work in the media center. Skills taught to these students should allow them to learn to evaluate and choose among sources, distinguish the real from the fanciful, draw conclusions, develop logical sequence of data, determine cause and effect, and observe pertinent details in the media they use.²⁹

As noted in the literature on actual programs that have been compiled for elementary media skills instruction, most media specialists or school district committees create their own programs after finding commercially prepared programs lacking or inappropriate for their pupils' needs. The five media skills guides selected for comparison in this research project fit this mode of thinking.

Most of the media skills programs summarized in the literature reviewed emphasized the importance of teaching a skill when a child needs it and is ready to use it. The author of the program used in the Jordan School District in Sandy, Utah lists "Skills Children Need" in her program handbook. Included among the skills were media center citizenship, care of materials, location of items in the media center, development of reference skills, and appreciation of all media center materials.³⁰ Ms. Dunyon's list of needed skills were compatible with the guidelines selected by this writer for comparison of the five media skills guides.

Other programs reviewed also support the concept of teaching skills when the need is evident and application is expected afterward. The program at J.C. Mitchell Elementary School in Boca Raton, Florida was

²⁹Pollette, op. cit., p. 102.

³⁰Eileen R. Dunyon, A Curriculum Based Media Program Describing Media Techniques Developed at Oakdale School in Jordan School District, U.S. Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 121 287, 1976.

created with the following emphasis in mind:

Skills are only mastered or learned as they are needed; skills presented may be absorbed, even stored, but the pay-off of the skills comes only from use ... skills too must be applied to specific learning situations and reinforced with systematic, sustained use to be mastered.³¹

The Astoria Park Elementary School program in Tallahassee, Florida advocates that "skills are the result of learning patterns that must be repeated often, consistently, and with a purpose."³² The media program at Peachtree Elementary School in Norcross, Georgia is based on personal and instructional needs as well as the observed curiosity and discovery levels of the child.³³ The library skills program at Buchanan Elementary School in Livonia, Michigan was designed for individualized learning, but with consideration of the needs of children for skills relevant to their learning.³⁴

The programs noted also emphasize the building of sequential skills for continuous learning. These skills are introduced, taught when needed, and reinforced through their integration into the school's curriculum.

Additional literature was reviewed concerning integration of media skills into the curriculum. Walker stated that instruction in connection with the school library was considered "library orientation" as late as the early 1960's. In the late 1960's, the school library

³¹D. Philip Baker, School and Public Library Media Programs for Children and Young Adults (Syracuse, New York: Gaylord Professional Publications, 1977), p. 104.

³²Ibid., p. 122.

³³Ibid., p. 132.

³⁴Ibid., p. 198.

served primarily to support classroom instruction. Currently, it is stressed that the media center be an active participant in instructional planning processes and a supporting participant in daily instruction.³⁵

Walker's book provides a model for integrating media skills instruction into the modern processes of teaching:

The school library was regarded as a passive depository of printed information only roughly related to the mainstream of instruction ... The current unified media concept identifies the media center as the very core of the school, housing all the media and materials of instruction and actively changing to reflect every innovation in the curriculum or instructional style of the school.³⁶

Some school programs have accomplished integration in one curricular area while some have achieved nearly total integration through team planning and implementation with teachers. The Lewistown-Porter Public Schools of Youngstown, New York were cited by Baker as having integrated the media program with the reading program,³⁷ while the Peachtree Elementary School program exemplified total integration.³⁸

The inclusion of nonprint media skills throughout the elementary media skills program adds another dimension to the ways a child can learn and satisfy natural curiosities. Information obtained by using nonprint such as filmstrips, videotapes, or recordings may provide motivation and interest that print materials alone cannot generate. When learning about the resources of the media center, elementary pupils should be exposed to or allowed to locate and use that media format with which

³⁵Walker, op. cit., p. 9.

³⁶Ibid., p. 12.

³⁷Baker, op. cit., p. 242.

³⁸Ibid., p. 133.

they will most likely succeed, and build upon those successes to develop and absorb additional skills.³⁹

While reviewing summaries of other programs, several positive statements were noted concerning the inclusion of nonprint skills in a media skills instruction program. For example, the Sea Girt Elementary School program in Sea Girt, New Jersey is described as having:

... evident success in using the print medium without denigrating the nonprint medium. This approach aims to develop both a literary and technical competency for children and reflects the importance of good literature to their learning. This, in turn, has an important bearing on the ability of the child to develop the entire visual literacy component.⁴⁰

An equally strong viewpoint on the use of nonprint media is taken in the Whitewater, Wisconsin schools. An elementary media skills curriculum is utilized there based on the concept that in the media center, newer learning materials, such as most nonprint formats, can be integrated with print materials to encourage successful, independent inquiry and study.⁴¹

To summarize the literature reviewed, it is evident that the elementary media center and its corresponding skills program have developed into vital components of the modern elementary school. In planning media skills experiences for elementary students, media professionals and designated committees have found that it is important to consider the needs, curiosities, and interests of both primary and intermediate level

³⁹Pollette, op. cit., p. 119.

⁴⁰Baker, op. cit., p. 119.

⁴¹Beverly L. Good, "Please - I Want to Do It Myself!", Wisconsin Library Bulletin, July, 1977, p. 153.

children. Print and nonprint sources both demand adequate exposure at all grade levels. Most programs developed and implemented in recent years have attempted to integrate skills teaching with one or more curricular areas so that students and teachers alike can understand the necessity of a media skills program's existence.

Chapter 3

METHODOLOGY

Comparison of several published guides for media skills instruction should involve more than one focus. Professionals in library science have, for many years, been concerned with sequential teaching of library skills as they fit the learning capacities of elementary students. However, with increased emphasis on integration of media and media-related skills with curriculum, it seems important to examine each guide selected in relation to all these areas.

Media specialists should be able to formulate a skills program on an integrated basis with greater ease by using the guides examined here which utilize the concept of integration. They might choose to select from other materials for introduction or review of formal media skills.

Five skills guides were sought that fit the following criteria:

1. Date of publication is 1970 or later;
2. Skills are distributed by grade levels from kindergarten through grade six;
3. General objectives are listed for the grade levels included;
4. Suggested or actual activities are provided to support the general objectives.

These criteria were chosen with the thought that current media professionals should use materials published within a recent period of time. Guides published within the last decade should contain updated strategies for teaching, and bibliographies for further consultation.

Skills guides for kindergarten and grades one through six were chosen because the scope of this study is directed toward the elementary school containing those grade levels. General objectives and supporting activities should be included within the skills guides because these components support a thorough teaching process.

The five guides chosen for comparison are:

1. Margrabe, Mary, The "Now" Library Media Center: A Stations Approach with Teaching Kit. Washington, D.C.: Acropolis Books, Ltd., 1973.
2. Schwarz, Edith, and others. Instructional Program for Library/Media Centers. U.S. Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 114 082, 1975.
3. Montgomery County Public Schools. Instructional Objectives for Media Research and Communication Skills. Suggested Scope and Sequence Chart. Rockville, Maryland; Montgomery County Public Schools, 1975.
4. Leon County Schools. Scope and Sequence of Media Skills K-12. Tallahassee, Florida; Leon County Media Specialists Association, 1976.
5. Wisconsin Department of Public Instruction. Learning to Use Media, Bulletin No. 197. Madison, Wisconsin; Wisconsin Department of Public Instruction, Division for Library Services, 1970.

These guides were compared for their content of general learning skills, topical skills unique to the media center, and philosophy related to integration. Forms were created to record the presence of these three areas. Definitions for the two sets of skills follow.

Operational Definitions

The nine general learning skills have been defined as follows:

1. Identification; to prove an item the same as something described.
2. Location; to search for and discover the position of an item.
3. Selection (preference); to choose; to know that one item of

media will meet one's needs better than another.

4. Utilization: to use independently without supervision or guidance.

5. Comprehension: to understand through description and verbalization practice.

6. Application: to use for a particular purpose.

7-8. Production/Creation: to write, construct, and prepare original materials for the use or understanding of others.

9. Presentation: to exhibit materials for the use or understanding of others.

The following definitions were used to determine the recording of each skills guide in respect to the thirteen topical areas unique to the media center.

1. Orientation to the media center; including manners, circulation procedures and limits, introduction to the media specialist.

2. Care of materials; using bookmarks, turning pages correctly, protecting media items from pets and young children, handling nonprint items correctly, and returning borrowed media items on time.

3. Location of media center materials; finding areas in the media center such as fiction, nonfiction, reference, nonprint, magazines, paperback books, the card catalog, and the vertical file.

4. Parts of a book; including cover, spine, copyright date, dedication, forward, title page, table of contents, index, illustrations, text, bibliography, and appendix.

5. The card catalog; using the author, title, and subject filing concepts, information contained on catalog cards, relating call letters or call number to arrangement in the media center, and including cards

for both print and nonprint media in one catalog.

6. Classification - the Dewey Decimal System; using the ten groups of the Dewey Decimal System and understanding their direct relationship to nonfiction items in the media center.

7. Arrangement of fiction and nonfiction; using the call letter or call number system to locate specific media items.

8. Research skills: using parts of a book, using main ideas, note-taking, outlining, cross-reference, footnotes, and bibliographies.

9. Use of reference materials; including dictionaries, encyclopedias, atlases, almanacs, specialized dictionaries and encyclopedias.

10. Magazines; learning about types, format, frequency of publication, currency of information, and scope of content.

11. Use of Readers' Guide to Periodical Literature; learning its purpose as an index to magazines, understanding format of entries, using index for retrieval of specific magazine articles.

12. Nonprint media and appropriate equipment; providing familiarity with and operation of filmloops, filmstrips, cassette and reel-to-reel tapes, slides, records, films, videotapes, and their corresponding players, recorders, or projectors; use of headphones, listening stations, overhead and opaque projectors, and simple cameras.

13. Creative activities involving local production; using existing media items and media production techniques as springboards toward production of items created by students.

Skills Guide Comparison

Each media skills guide selected was analyzed according to the following procedure:

1. The chart or written summary listing skills contained in

each guide was analyzed and information was recorded on Form A. (See Appendix A.) The top portion of Form A was marked to indicate appearance of general learning skills. In keeping with a philosophy of integration of media skills teaching with school curriculum, the top portion of Form A was marked only if that particular guide could be used by the media specialist to appropriately relate media to the curriculum. Each of the nine skills was marked with an "x" if that particular learning skill was presented in a description of a topical skill which was introduced or taught at that particular grade level.

The bottom portion of Form A was marked to compare treatment of topical skills unique to the media center. (See Appendix A.) The following coding was used as each skill was plotted:

I - This skill is introduced to students at this grade level as their initial encounter.

T - This skill is taught to students at this grade level, meaning that instruction is provided and suitable application of the skill follows.

R - This skill is reviewed or reinforced with students at this grade level.

2. Appearance of initial instruction for a skill at the primary or intermediate level was recorded for each guide on a second form, labeled as Form B. (See Appendix B.) This form compares the five guides in relation to their instruction in the topical areas unique to the media center, with additional consideration toward placement of those skills emphasized in the primary grades, and those emphasized in the intermediate grades.

The tabulations on Form A were used to complete Form B. Each skills guide was recorded on this form. An "x" was marked for a particular skills guide if the question listed next to each group of skills could be answered "yes." No mark was made if a "no" response was the result.

3. Evidence of the integrated approach to teaching media skills was recorded on a third form, labeled as Form C. (See Appendix C.) Introductory statements from each guide concerning integration were quoted, with additional judgment made by this writer as to whether that guide utilizes or has potential for utilizing an integrated approach. A separate form was completed for each guide.

A number of problems were encountered in recording the characteristics of the guides. For example, not all guides listed the skills taught by single grade levels. A summary of the recording for each guide follows, including problems and resolutions in charting, with examples where appropriate.

Guide 1 - Margrabe: Some problems in exact grade level recording occurred with this guide because the author did not feel that a specific grade level had to be assigned to a particular skill station. Also, the problem of marking any skills with an "I" symbol for introduction emerged because the skills in this guide were charted from the section of the guide entitled "A Summary of Skills Taught by Level in This Program" which did not differentiate the level of instruction. All skills taught were recorded with the "T" symbol, since the guide stated that the skills were taught, not introduced, at the levels specified. No "R" symbols for review appear on Form A for the Margrabe guide for the same reason. (See Appendix A.)

By examining the bottom portion of Form A for Margrabe, one can observe that "T" markings were recorded for each grade level for some topical skills. It appears that more detailed content is taught at the upper grade levels when teaching also occurs at the lower grade levels. For example, skills that were recorded as "T" skills under the card catalog topical skill heading included that a student was "to be able to find the call number of a fiction book whose title is known by looking in the card catalog." This was listed as a suggested skill for kindergarten and grades one and two. A card catalog skill for grades three and four stated that a student should "be able to use the card catalog to determine whether or not the center has a certain piece of material if the author and/or title is given." Students in grades five and six were "to become acquainted with the three types of catalog cards: author, title, and subject card."⁴²

Guide 2 - Schwarz: This guide provided two sources from which to record skills. An overview of skills covered in each guide preceded the extensive charts that gave each skill a planned (P), taught (T), or reviewed (R) ranking.⁴³ These charts were written in a very detailed manner. Many minor components of a skill were listed following its general heading, and each component was assigned a P, T, or R ranking. It was difficult to determine an accurate summary of introductory (I),

⁴²Mary Margrabe, The "Now" Library Media Center: A Stations Approach with Teaching Kit (Washington, D.C.: Acropolis Books, Ltd., 1973), p. 144.

⁴³Edith Schwarz, Instructional Program for Library/Media Centers. U.S. Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 114 082, 1975.

taught (T), or reviewed (R) rankings in such cases. For example, under the heading "Understanding Parts of a Book", separate P, T, and R rankings were given for the book as a whole, the title page, verso, table of contents, index, glossary, lists of maps and illustrations, dedication, forward, text of book, appendix, bibliography, and development of the book. In this particular case, the rankings given for the "book as a whole" category were recorded.⁴⁴

This problem in recording was resolved in one of two ways: either by recording I, T, or R at given grade levels for the most general description of the skill given, or by marking the grade level where a skill was initially introduced, taught, or reviewed.

Guide 3 - Montgomery County: This guide also listed components of skills in detail under each general topical skill area. For example, separate introductory, mastery, and maintenance levels were recorded for 26 different parts of a book in the "Understandings about Materials" section.⁴⁵ The initial introduction, teaching, or review sequence was summarized and recorded for the skills listed in such detail.

A separate scope and sequence chart accompanied this guide. Although it presented a comparison of general learning skills in an organized fashion, this chart was not used on the comparison chart because Levels A-B-C-D-E were assigned to skill competencies instead of grade levels.

Guide 4 - Leon County: This guide grouped grade levels in the

⁴⁴Ibid.

⁴⁵Montgomery County Public Schools, Instructional Objectives for Media Research and Communication Skills. Suggested Scope and Sequence Chart (Rockville, Maryland: Montgomery County Public Schools, 1975), p. 9.

following manner when recording skills: K-1; 2-3; 4-5; 6-7-8 (middle school). The comparison forms were marked in that manner.

An explanation was given for the "x" markings for the guide, stating that "x indicates the grade(s) at which a skill may be introduced. These skills should be reinforced each year on a continual basis from grade to grade through grade 12."⁴⁶ Therefore, "I" was used for the initial introduction and "R" for each year afterward that the skill was to be reinforced. No "T" symbols were recorded for this guide.

An "I" was recorded for each grade level in the case of some topical skills because an "x" appeared at each grade level in the guide. For example, under the "Reference Tools" heading, picture dictionaries are introduced at grades K-1; handbooks and manuals at grades 2-3; encyclopedias at grades 4-5; and yearbooks at grade 6.⁴⁷

An "I" was marked in each grade level box since different reference sources were introduced at each level and a summary could not be arrived at.

General learning skills were not recorded in the top portion of Form A for this guide. Such skills were not directly stated, according to the definitions used in this report.

Guide 5 - Wisconsin Department of Public Instruction: The Wisconsin guide grouped elementary grade levels in the following manner: K-2; 3-4; and 5-6. Recording on the comparison forms was completed

⁴⁶Leon County Schools, Scope and Sequence of Media Skills K-12 (Tallahassee, Florida: Leon County Media Specialists Association, 1976), p. 10.

⁴⁷Ibid., p. 13.

according to this grouping structure. The "I" symbol was used exclusively for this guide, because no reference was made either to the systematic teaching of these skills or to review. Although review might occur after teaching, this thought was not stated in the guide.

An "I" was recorded for each grade level for the topical skill "nonprint materials and equipment". The following quotations from the guide illustrate the reason for such recording:

The media specialist will "have books, records, tapes, and filmstrips ready for students to use during browsing time." This was listed as a skill for kindergarten and grades one and two. For grades three and four, the media specialist will "teach small groups how to operate a tape recorder, sound filmstrip projector, filmstrip and slide projector, and 8 mm filmloop projector through classroom lecture, demonstration, or on closed circuit television." In grades five and six, students can "show a film or filmstrip or play tapes by or about an author."⁴⁸

Like the Leon County guide (Guide 4), general learning skills were not recorded because they were not directly stated, according to the definitions used in this report.

⁴⁸Wisconsin Department of Public Instruction, Learning to Use Media, Bulletin No. 197 (Madison, Wisconsin: Wisconsin Department of Public Instruction, Division for Library Services, 1970), p. 9.

Chapter 4

ANALYSIS OF DATA

The first hypothesis in this study states: Each guide chosen will provide learning experiences in six out of nine of the categories listed when tallying grade-placement level in relation to the general objectives of learning as directed toward integration.

Table 1
General Learning Skills in Guides

Guide	Anticipated Number	Number of Skills
1	6	9
2	6	6
3	6	9
4	6	0
5	6	0

Guide 1 and Guide 3 provided learning experiences in all nine general learning skills. Guide 2 provided learning experiences in six of the nine general learning skills. Learning experiences for creation, production, and presentation were not provided in Guide 2. Guide 4 and Guide 5 provided no learning experiences in relation to general learning skills. No corresponding language was included in either guide that matched any definitions given to general learning skills. Guides 4 and

5 did not appear to be for integration of media skills into the curriculum. Since only three of the five guides provided learning experiences in six of the nine general learning skills, the first hypothesis was rejected.

The second hypothesis states: Each guide chosen will provide learning experiences in nine out of thirteen of the categories listed when tallying grade-placement level in relation to the topical areas unique to the media center.

Table 2
Topical Areas in Guides

Guide	Anticipated Number	Number of Skills
1	9	13
2	9	13
3	9	11
4	9	12
5	9	12

All thirteen of the topical areas were found in Guides 1 and 2. Twelve of the thirteen topical areas were found in Guides 4 and 5. Guide 4 did not provide learning experiences for creative activities (topical area 13). Guide 5 did not provide learning experiences for parts of a book (topical area 4). Eleven of the thirteen topical areas were found in Guide 3, with no learning experiences provided in Dewey classification (topical area 6), and research (topical area 8).

As noted in the discussions of each guide concerning the problems in recording data, all guides were not charted using all three symbols.

However, any evidence of a learning experience was tallied, in keeping with the language of this hypothesis. Since each guide exceeded the prediction, the second hypothesis was accepted.

The third and fourth hypotheses are closely related because both predict that initial instruction will occur in the first eleven topical areas. (See Appendix B.) Topical areas one through four are directed toward the primary grades. Topical areas five through eleven are directed toward the intermediate grades.

Data related to the third and fourth hypotheses is summarized in Table 3. An "x" indicates that the guide provides initial instruction in the designated topical area.

*Archived paper
such as this should
not occur. An alternative
would be to let Table 3
follow p. 37 by itself
and continue over to
here.*

Table 3

Occurrences of Initial Instruction in Topical Areas 1-11

Primary Topical Area	Guide					Total
	1	2	3	4	5	
1. Orientation	x	x	x	x	x	5
2. Care of Materials	x	x	x	x	x	5
3. Location of Materials	x	x	x	x	x	5
4. Parts of a Book		x	x	x		3
Total	3	4	4	4	3	18

Intermediate Topical Area	Guide					Total
	1	2	3	4	5	
5. Card Catalog	x		x	x	x	4
6. Classification (Dewey)	x	x		x	x	4
7. Arrangement - Fiction/Nonfiction	x		x			2
8. Research	x	x		x	x	4
9. Reference	x	x	x	x	x	5
10. Magazines	x	x	x		x	4
11. <u>Readers' Guide</u>	x	x	x		x	4
Total	7	5	5	4	6	27

The third hypothesis states that among all five guides, 75 percent of the initial instruction in the first four topical areas unique to the media center will be found to occur in the primary grades, or in kindergarten and grades one through three.

Guides 2, 3, and 4 provided initial instruction in all four topical areas in the primary grades. Guide 1 and Guide 5 provided initial instruction in three of the four topical areas. Instruction in parts of a book (topical area 4) was not provided for the primary grades in those two guides.

There were twenty instances when instruction was possible. Eighteen instances were found. This is equivalent to a 90 percent occurrence. Because 75 percent was needed and 90 percent was achieved, the third hypothesis was accepted.

The fourth hypothesis states that among all five guides, 75 percent of the initial instruction in topical areas numbered five through eleven that are unique to the media center will be found to occur in the intermediate grades, or in grades four through six.

Guide 1 provided initial instruction in all seven topical areas in the intermediate grades. Guide 5 provided instruction in six areas, with no instruction provided for arrangement of fiction and nonfiction (topical area 7). Guide 2 and Guide 3 each provided instruction in five topical areas. Guide 2 provided no instruction for the card catalog (topical area 5) and arrangement of fiction and nonfiction (topical area 7). Guide 3 provided no instruction in Dewey classification (topical area 6) and research (topical area 8). Guide 4 provided instruction in four of the seven areas, with no instruction provided for arrangement of fiction and nonfiction (topical area 7), magazines (topical area 10), and the Readers' Guide to Periodical Literature (topical area 11).

There were thirty-five instances where instruction was possible. Twenty-seven instances were found. This is equivalent to a 77 percent occurrence. Because 75 percent was needed and 77 percent was achieved,

the fourth hypothesis was accepted.

The fifth hypothesis states that instruction, for the purpose of introduction, actual teaching, or review in topical areas numbered twelve and thirteen that are unique to the media center will be found to occur in both primary and intermediate grades in four out of five of the guides chosen for comparison.

Table 4

Occurrences of Instruction in Topical Areas 12 and 13

Topical Area	Guide					Total
	1	2	3	4	5	
12. Nonprint Materials and Equipment (Pri)	x	x	x	x	x	5
Nonprint Materials and Equipment (Int)	x		x	x	x	4
13. Creative Activities (Pri)	x	x	x		x	4
Creative Activities (Int)	x	x	x		x	4
Total	4	3	4	2	4	17

Guides 1, 3, and 5 provided instruction in the topical areas for both primary and intermediate levels. Guide 2 provided instruction in three areas, with no instruction provided in nonprint materials and equipment at the intermediate level (topical area 12). Guide 4 provided instruction in nonprint materials and equipment for both grade level groups. However, no instruction was provided for creative activities at either level for Guide 4.

Because only three of the five guides provided instruction in both topical areas at the primary and intermediate levels, the fifth hypothesis was rejected.

The sixth hypothesis states that at least three of the five guides chosen for comparison will, through justification contained within, be found to support the philosophy of integrating media skills with components of the elementary school curriculum.

The first guide by Mary Margrabe states that "instructors of all levels could incorporate many of these ideas in their curriculum ... the skills may be introduced in parts as needed to suit the child's curriculum ...⁴⁹ ... The media specialist will need to maintain an even closer liaison than usual with class and group activities ... to be able to recommend the teaching of skills when needed ...⁵⁰ ... without the teachers' knowledge, help, support, understanding, and cooperation, this program could not be successfully completed."⁵¹ It seems reasonable to conclude that this guide can be readily adapted to an integrated approach to teaching media skills.

A statement clearly advocating integration is included in the school library philosophy of the second guide by Edith Schwarz. It states that the purpose in writing this guide was "to provide a planned, purposeful, and educationally significant program which will be appropriately integrated with the classroom teaching and learning program."⁵²

⁴⁹Margrabe, op. cit., p. 10.

⁵⁰Ibid., p. 15.

⁵¹Ibid., p. 20.

⁵²Schwarz, op. cit., p. 1.

Also, the appendix containing the sequence of media skills activities was "designed to correlate with the various curriculum areas to provide a logical program of instruction through the grades."⁵³ These statements of philosophy show that this second guide chosen for comparison supports the concepts of integration.

The third media skills guide, from the Montgomery County, Maryland schools, contains supporting statements for the integration of media skills into the curriculum:

The introduction and continued application of these process skills are best achieved through their integration with the objectives identified in all skill and content areas of the instructional program. Joint planning by teachers and media specialists in developing strategies, assessment measures, and determining instructional responsibilities is imperative.⁵⁴

The fourth and fifth guides did not appear to advocate a philosophy toward integration. The fourth guide, from the Leon County, Florida schools, is suggested as an exemplary model of a scope and sequence guide to teaching media skills in Thomas Hart's book, Instruction in School Media Center Use. He feels that "while it is possible to use many of these library activities in conjunction with classroom work, the intent is to make instruction in library use an end in itself."⁵⁵ It seems that making media skills instruction an end in itself is in support of an isolationist philosophy in regard to media center use.

Two brief statements in the fifth guide from the Wisconsin Department of Public Instruction suggest some combination of media skills with

⁵³Ibid., p. 22.

⁵⁴Montgomery County Public Schools, op. cit., p. 2.

⁵⁵Thomas L. Hart, Instruction in School Media Center Use (Chicago: American Library Association, 1978), p. 1.

classroom teaching, but with no directly stated support for concentrated integration with curriculum. The compilers of this guide suggested that skills might "correlate with classroom teaching" and that the teacher might "follow up classroom instruction with individual help."⁵⁶ Although the guide does not contain statements that disagree with use in an integrated fashion, true support for integration does not appear to be evident.

In summary, three of the five guides did contain written justification of support for an integrated philosophy of teaching media skills. The sixth hypothesis was accepted, although through more subjective means than the other five hypotheses treated in this report.

⁵⁶Wisconsin Department of Public Instruction, op. cit., p. 6.

Chapter 5

SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This study compared five published media skills guides for the presence of nine general learning skills, thirteen topical areas unique to the media center, and potential for integration into the elementary school curriculum. Six hypotheses were generated and tested concerning these three areas.

The first hypothesis stated that each of the five guides would provide initial instruction in general learning skills. This hypothesis was rejected since only three of the guides met this expectation.

Each guide was anticipated to provide initial instruction in nine of the thirteen topical areas in the second hypothesis. This hypothesis was accepted since each guide exceeded the anticipated results by providing initial instruction in at least eleven of the thirteen topical areas.

The third hypothesis stated that 75 percent of the initial instruction in topical areas one through four would occur in the primary grades. These topical areas achieved a 90 percent level of initial instruction, thus exceeding the anticipated outcome and allowing this hypothesis to be accepted.

The fourth hypothesis also stated a 75 percent occurrence of initial instruction, in topical areas five through eleven in the intermediate grades. This hypothesis was accepted as the seven topical areas achieved a 77 percent level of initial instruction.

Four of the five guides were to provide initial instruction in topical areas twelve and thirteen for both primary and intermediate grades as stated in the fifth hypothesis. This hypothesis was rejected since only three of the five guides provided initial instruction in the two topical areas for both grade level groups.

The sixth hypothesis stated that support for an integrated philosophy for teaching media skills would be found in introductory statements from three of the five guides. This hypothesis was accepted since three of the five guides contained support for integration in their statements of philosophy.

Conclusions

In reviewing the methods of comparison used for the media skills guides, it appears that the guides chosen included topical areas within their scope and gave them appropriate consideration regarding introduction or instruction. Three of the five guides utilized language related to general learning skills to present the topical skills. Also, three of the guides appear to be written in a manner that would allow integration of media skills into the curriculum. A thorough examination of the guides was completed during this study which led to greater familiarity with both strong and weak points of each.

Although five guides were located which presented elementary media skills in comparison format, all guides did not fit the criteria for inclusion as adequately as anticipated. Difficulty was encountered in comparing the guides exactly by the measures created and used in this study. The guides varied in their style of summarizing skills, detail in describing skills, and the method used to record grade-level placement of skills. As a result, some of the recording completed in this study

appeared repetitive when compared with the guide itself.

The first hypothesis was difficult to test with two of the media skills guides. Guide 4 and Guide 5 did not directly state their objectives in terms of the general learning skills defined for recording purposes. However, the definitions were easily applied to the three guides that did use general learning skills in their instructional plans.

The acceptance of the second hypothesis indicates that the five guides placed adequate emphasis on instruction of appropriate topical areas unique to the media center. Although the third, fourth, and fifth hypotheses were also concerned with the topical areas, it became obvious that the questions placed on Form B to test those hypotheses were rather limiting. If the questions on that form had been reworded, additional beneficial data might have been obtained. For example, if the first question on Form B had been divided into two questions, more detail might have emerged in comparing skills introduced in the primary and intermediate grades.

The fifth hypothesis might have been more accurately tested if topical areas twelve and thirteen were separated and results tabulated. More logical conclusions might have been drawn about the presence of non-print instruction in these elementary media skills guides if those two topical areas were considered separately.

The sixth hypothesis was tested through written introductions or philosophy statements in the guides and not through tabulations based on content of skills contained in the guide. The concept of integration was included in the comparison of these skills guides because it appears that integrating media skills with curriculum projects the importance of teaching elementary media skills.

It appears that all the guides used in this study were written specifically for a particular school building or school district. Therefore, the format for each guide was tailored for that immediate audience. However, many similar elements were part of each guide, such as some type of list of skills introduced or taught, and a recommended grade level or levels grouped together where the emphasis on the skill should occur.

Recommendations

This study can best be used by professionals in elementary media centers as an overview of five recently published guides for media skills instruction, with comparisons of the guides serving as a selection tool toward choice of a guide or a combination of guides upon which to pattern their own media skills program. With the inclusion of guides that advocate integration, the decision to choose one guide over another should be facilitated if the media professional wished to implement an integrated media skills program.

Guide 1, by Margrabe, best serves as a stations-type approach to teaching media skills. Any portion of these stations could be utilized by the media specialist to teach certain skills. The content of the stations could be modified to include subject areas toward integration with curriculum. Grade-level suggestions could be adapted downward or upward to fit content as encountered in the particular subject.

Guide 2, by Schwarz, is best used when the media specialist wishes to instruct pupils on specific media center resources and detailed skills in both the print and nonprint areas.

Guide 3, from Montgomery County, contains a detailed plan for instruction in print and nonprint resources as they fit with curriculum.

This guide also contains a scope and sequence chart which could be carefully followed in planning a thorough sequence of media skills instruction. It is structured as a type of cross-reference chart to the skills guide.

Guide 4, from Leon County, expresses its instructional levels toward teaching media skills in a general fashion. If one desires detail to be given in the guide used as a model, Guide 2 or Guide 3 would be more appropriate.

Guide 5, from Wisconsin, gives description of skills to be introduced or taught rather than using a grade-level chart. The suggestions for each grade level appear to be in summarized form, and would demand considerable expansion to emerge with a complete media skills program.

In deciding to use any of the five guides as models for future programs, media specialists will need to check the recommended grade levels for teaching certain skills against the structure of their individual buildings and the apparent learning capacities of their students.

A future study of media skills guides might investigate the depth of integration with media skills teaching in particular subject areas in the elementary curriculum. The concept of integration seems to provide many topics for further comparison.

Studies completed in the future will hopefully show that increasing numbers of guides are being published for the use of others in the profession. Several valuable sources, including three guides, were published within the last four years, making this study more complete. It is hoped that this publishing trend will continue.

APPENDIX A

GENERAL LEARNING SKILLS AND TOPICAL SKILLS TABULATED FOR EACH GUIDE
Guide 1: Margrabe

General Learning Skill	Grade Level						
	K	1	2	3	4	5	6
1. Identification	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
2. Location	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
3. Selection (preference)				X	X	X	X
4. Utilization	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
5. Comprehension	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
6. Application	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
7. Creation				X	X	X	X
8. Production	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
9. Presentation	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
Topical Skill							
1. Orientation	T	T	T				
2. Care of Materials	T	T	T	T	T		
3. Location of Materials	T	T	T	T	T	T	T
4. Parts of a Book						T	T
5. Card Catalog	T	T	T	T	T	T	T
6. Classification (Dewey)						T	T
7. Arrangement (Fiction/Nonfiction)	T	T	T	T	T		
8. Research						T	T
9. Reference				T	T	T	T
10. Magazines						T	T
11. <u>Readers' Guide</u>						T	T
12. Nonprint materials and equipment	T	T	T	T	T	T	T
13. Creative activities (involving local production)	T	T	T	T	T	T	T

Key: I=Introduced T=taught R=Reviewed

General Learning Skill	Grade Level						
	K	1	2	3	4	5	6
1. Identification	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
2. Location	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
3. Selection (preference)		X	X	X	X	X	X
4. Utilization	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
5. Comprehension	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
6. Application	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
7. Creation							
8. Production							
9. Presentation							
Topical Skill							
1. Orientation	I	T	T	R	R	R	R
2. Care of Materials	I	T	T	R	R	R	R
3. Location of Materials	I	T	T	R	R	R	R
4. Parts of a Book	I	T	T	R	R	R	R
5. Card Catalog		I	I	T	T	R	R
6. Classification (Dewey)				T	T	R	R
7. Arrangement (Fiction/Nonfiction)		I	T	T	R	R	R
8. Research				I	T	T	T
9. Reference			I	T	T	R	R
10. Magazines		I	I	I	I	I	T
11. <u>Readers' Guide</u>					I	I	T
12. Nonprint materials and equipment	I	I	T	R	R	R	R
13. Creative activities (involving local production)	I	I	I	I	I	I	I

Key: I=Introduced T=taught R=Reviewed

GENERAL LEARNING SKILLS AND TOPICAL SKILLS TABULATED FOR EACH GUIDE
Guide 3: Montgomery County

General Learning Skill	Grade Level						
	K	1	2	3	4	5	6
1. Identification	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
2. Location	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
3. Selection (preference)				X	X	X	X
4. Utilization	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
5. Comprehension	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
6. Application		X	X	X	X	X	X
7. Creation	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
8. Production	X	X	X	X	X	X	X
9. Presentation				X	X	X	X
Topical Skill							
1. Orientation	I	T	R	R	R	R	R
2. Care of Materials	I	T	R	R	R	R	R
3. Location of Materials	I	I	T	T	T	R	R
4. Parts of a Book	I	T	T	R	R	R	R
5. Card Catalog			I	I	T	R	R
6. Classification (Dewey)							
7. Arrangement (Fiction/Nonfiction)	I	I	I	I	T	R	R
8. Research							
9. Reference	I	I	T	T	T	T	R
10. Magazines			I	I	I	I	T
11. <u>Readers' Guide</u>						I	I
12. Nonprint materials and equipment	I	I	T	T	T	R	R
13. Creative activities (involving local production)	I	I	T	T	T	R	R

Key: I=Introduced T=taught R=Reviewed

GENERAL LEARNING SKILLS AND TOPICAL SKILLS TABULATED FOR EACH GUIDE
Guide 4: Leon County

General Learning Skill	Grade Level							
	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	
1. Identification		GENERAL LEARNING						
2. Location		SKILLS WERE						
3. Selection (preference)		NOT RECORDED						
4. Utilization		FOR THIS GUIDE						
5. Comprehension								
6. Application								
7. Creation								
8. Production								
9. Presentation								
Topical Skill								
1. Orientation	I	I	R	R	R	R	R	
2. Care of Materials	I	I	R	R	R	R	R	
3. Location of Materials	I	I	R	R	R	R	R	
4. Parts of a Book	I	I	I	I	R	R	R	
5. Card Catalog			I	I	I	I	R	
6. Classification (Dewey)			I	I	I	I	R	
7. Arrangement (Fiction/Nonfiction)	I	I	R	R	R	R	R	
8. Research					I	I	I	
9. Reference	I	I	I	I	I	I	I	
10. Magazines	I	I	R	R	R	R	R	
11. <u>Readers' Guide</u>			I	I	R	R	R	
12. Nonprint materials and equipment	I	I	I	I	I	I	I	
13. Creative activities (involving local production)								

Key: I=Introduced T=taught R=Reviewed

GENERAL LEARNING SKILLS AND TOPICAL SKILLS TABULATED FOR EACH GUIDE
Guide 5: Wisconsin

General Learning Skill	Grade Level							
	K	1	2	3	4	5	6	
1. Identification			GENERAL LEARNING					
2. Location			SKILLS WERE					
3. Selection (preference)			NOT RECORDED					
4. Utilization			FOR THIS GUIDE.					
5. Comprehension								
6. Application								
7. Creation								
8. Production								
9. Presentation								
Topical Skill								
1. Orientation	I	I	I					
2. Care of Materials	I	I	I					
3. Location of Materials	I	I	I	I	I	I	I	
4. Parts of a Book								
5. Card Catalog				I	I			
6. Classification (Dewey)				I	I	I	I	
7. Arrangement (Fiction/Nonfiction)	I	I	I					
8. Research						I	I	
9. Reference				I	I	I	I	
10. Magazines						I	I	
11. <u>Readers' Guide</u>				I	I	I	I	
12. Nonprint materials and equipment	I	I	I	I	I	I	I	
13. Creative activities (involving local production)				I	I	I	I	

Key: I=Introduced T=taught R=Reviewed

APPENDIX B

SUMMARY OF TOPICAL SKILLS BY PRIMARY AND INTERMEDIATE GRADES

Question	Topical Area	Guide				
		1	2	3	4	5
Does this guide provide instruction in this topical area in the primary grades?	1. Orientation	X	X	X	X	X
	2. Care of Materials	X	X	X	X	X
	3. Location of Materials	X	X	X	X	X
	4. Parts of a Book		X	X	X	
Does this guide provide instruction in this topical area in the intermediate grades?	5. Card Catalog	X		X	X	X
	6. Classification (Dewey)	X	X		X	X
	7. Arrangement (Fiction/Nonfiction)	X		X		
	8. Research	X	X		X	X
	9. Reference	X	X	X	X	X
	10. Magazines	X	X	X		X
	11. <u>Readers' Guide</u>	X	X	X		X
Does this guide provide instruction in this topical area in both primary and intermediate grades?	12. Nonprint materials and equipment (Primary)	X	X	X	X	X
	Nonprint materials and equipment (Intermediate)	X		X	X	X
	13. Creative activities (Pri)	X	X	X		X
	Creative activities (Int)	X	X	X		X

Key: X = yes

Blank = no

APPENDIX C

Form C

EVIDENCE OF INTEGRATED APPROACH

Guide 1: Margrabe

Skills Guide

1. Does this guide utilize the integrated approach to teaching media skills? Ideas are contained in the introduction to the guide that emphasize integration.
2. Does this guide have the potential to be an integrated approach to teaching media skills? Yes

3. Introductory statements or philosophy which support or do not support the philosophy of integration:

"Instructors of **all** levels could incorporate many of these ideas in their curriculum, since multi-media is fast increasing in all disciplines."

"... the skills may be introduced in parts as needed to suit the child's curriculum..."

"... the media specialist will need to maintain an even closer liaison than usual with class and group activities ... to be able to recommend the teaching of skills when needed."

"Without the teachers' knowledge, help, support, understanding, and cooperation, this program could not be successfully completed."

"Ideally, the teachers will provide 'follow-up' ... by assigning practical work that will allow the students to apply those skills recently learned."

It appears that the content and subject matter of certain stations within this guide would need to be changed in order to facilitate integration with the curriculum.

Form C

EVIDENCE OF INTEGRATED APPROACH

Guide 2: Schwarz

Skills Guide

1. Does this guide utilize the integrated approach to teaching media skills? Yes. This guide was written with this philosophy in mind.
2. Does this guide have the potential to be an integrated approach to teaching media skills?
3. Introductory statements or philosophy which support or do not support the philosophy of integration:

Part of the policy statement of the district concerning school library philosophy states that the purpose in writing this guide was "to provide a planned, purposeful, and educationally significant program which will be appropriately integrated with the classroom teaching and learning program."

"... in the implementation of skill objectives it is imperative that close cooperation exist between the classroom teacher and the librarian."

The appendix containing the sequence of media skills activities was "designed to correlate with the various curriculum areas to provide a logical program of instruction through the grades."

Form C

EVIDENCE OF INTEGRATED APPROACH

Guide 3: Montgomery County

Skills Guide

1. Does this guide utilize the integrated approach to teaching media skills? Yes

2. Does this guide have the potential to be an integrated approach to teaching media skills?

3. Introductory statements or philosophy which support or do not support the philosophy of integration:

"The introduction and continued application of these process skills are best achieved through their integration with the objectives identified in all skill and content areas of the instructional program. Joint planning by teachers and media specialists in developing strategies, assessment measures, and determining instructional responsibilities is imperative."

Form C

EVIDENCE OF INTEGRATED APPROACH

Guide 4, Leon County

Skills Guide

1. Does this guide utilize the integrated approach to teaching media skills? No
2. Does this guide have the potential to be an integrated approach to teaching media skills? Yes
3. Introductory statements or philosophy which support or do not support the philosophy of integration:

The Leon County skills guide is included in Instruction in School Media Center Use, by Thomas L. Hart. In his introduction, he states, "This book is designed to bring together many concepts which will assist the library media specialist in presenting creative and innovative library media center instructional activities. While it is possible to use many of these library activities in conjunction with classroom work, the intent is to make instruction in library use an end in itself."

It appears that it would be the decision of the user of this guide to adapt the guide either to an isolated or an integrated approach.

Form C

EVIDENCE OF INTEGRATED APPROACH

Guide 5: Wisconsin

Skills Guide

1. Does this guide utilize the integrated approach to teaching media skills? No

2. Does this guide have the potential to be an integrated approach to teaching media skills? Yes

3. Introductory statements or philosophy which support or do not support the philosophy of integration:

Two brief references to this effect are made: "... correlate with classroom teaching" and "... follow up classroom instruction with individual help".

The skills contained in this guide could be utilized toward an integrated approach to teaching media skills if desired by the user. However, definite support of integration with the curriculum is not evident in this guide.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Ahlers, Eleanor E. "Instruction in Library Skills," School Libraries, Spring 1972, pp. 23-25.
- Ainsworth, Len. "An Objective Measure of the Impact of a Library Learning Center," School Libraries, Winter 1969, pp. 33-35.
- Baitinger, L.E. "Trying on New Media Skills," Wisconsin Library Bulletin, July 1977, pp. 151-152.
- Baker, D. Philip. School and Public Library Media Programs for Children and Young Adults. Syracuse, New York: Gaylord Professional Publications, 1977.
- Beck, Margaret V. and Vera M. Pace. A Guidebook for Teaching Library Skills. Minneapolis: T.S. Denison and Company, Inc., 1967.
- Bender, David R. and Rosa L. Presberry. Services of a School Media Program. U.S. Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 126 908, 1976.
- Blackwell, Elizabeth N. "A Sequence of Library Skills," Hoosier School Libraries, February 1975, pp. 18-20.
- Contra Costa County Department of Education, Educational Media Services. Handbook for Elementary Library Media Instruction, revised edition. U.S. Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 125 652, 1975.
- Dunyon, Eileen R. A Curriculum Based Media Program Describing Media Techniques Developed at Oakdale School in Jordan School District. U.S. Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 121 287, 1976.
- Freeman, Patricia. Pathfinder: An Operational Guide for the School Librarian. New York: Harper and Row, 1975.
- Gaver, Mary Virginia. Patterns of Development in Elementary School Libraries Today: A Five Year Report on Emerging Media Centers. 3d. ed. Chicago: Encyclopaedia Britannica, Inc., 1969.
- Gaver, Mary Virginia. "Research on Elementary School Libraries," American Library Association Bulletin, February 1962, pp. 117-126.
- Gillespie, John T. and Diana L. Spirt. Creating a School Media Program. New York: R.R. Bowker Co., 1973.

- Gillespie, Mary, and others. Curriculum Guide for Teaching Library Media Skills, Kindergarten - Eighth Grade. U.S. Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 102 962, 1974.
- Glogau, Lillian, Edmund Krause, and Miriam Wexler. Developing a Successful Elementary School Media Center. West Nyack, New York: Parker Publishing Co., Inc., 1972.
- Good, Beverly L. "Please - I Want to Do It Myself!", Wisconsin Library Bulletin, July 1977, pp. 153-154.
- Grant, La Rue Tucker. "Library Lesson, Constructed on Piagetian Principles, for Use in Self-Service Elementary Instructional Media Centers," Texas Library Journal, Winter 1977, pp. 24-27.
- Hart, Thomas L., ed. Instruction in School Media Center Use. Chicago: American Library Association, 1978.
- Hostrop, Richard W. Education Inside the Library Media Center. Hamden, Connecticut: Linnet Books, 1973.
- Iadanza, Margret A. The Development of a Bibliography of Library Skills Instructional Resources. U.S. Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 114 085, 1975.
- Leopold, Carolyn C. "School Librarians: Are We For Real?" School Library Journal, April 15, 1971, pp. 26-30.
- McLean, Daphne Jeanne. "A Study of the Necessity of Library Skills Instruction in the Primary Grades," Master of Arts thesis, California State University, 1972.
- Oklahoma Curriculum Improvement Commission and Oklahoma State Department of Education, Library and Learning Resources Section. Curriculum Guide for the Teaching of Media Skills K-12. U.S. Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 125 655, 1975.
- Palovic, Lora, and Elizabeth Goodman. The Elementary School Library in Action. New York: Prentice-Hall Publishers, Inc., 1968.
- Pollette, Nancy. Developing Methods of Inquiry: A Source Book for Elementary Media Personnel. Metuchen, New Jersey: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 1973.
- Sullivan, Peggy, ed. Realization: The Final Report of the Knapp School Libraries Project. Chicago: American Library Association, 1968.
- Walker, Thomas H. Teaching Media Skills. Littleton, Colorado: Libraries Unlimited, Inc., 1977.
- Ward, Pearl L. and Robert Beacon, comps. The School Media Center: A Book of Readings. Metuchen, New Jersey: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 1973.

- Willson, Ella Jean. "Evaluating Urban Centralized Elementary School Libraries." Dissertation Abstracts International, 27: pp. 1567-68A, December 1966.
- Wishman, June. "Library Curriculum Instructional Skills Scope and Sequence Chart K-12." Van Meter, Iowa: Van Meter Community Schools, 1978. (Mimeographed.)
- Yarling, James Robert Sr. "Children's Understandings and Use of Selected Library-Related Skills in Two Elementary Schools, One With and One Without a Centralized Library." Dissertation Abstracts International, 29: pp. 3352-53A, April 1969.

FIVE GUIDES CHOSEN FOR COMPARISON

- Leon County Schools. Scope and Sequence of Media Skills K-12. Tallahassee, Florida: Leon County Media Specialists Association, 1976.
- Margrabe, Mary. The "Now" Library Media Center: A Stations Approach with Teaching Kit. Washington, D.C.: Acropolis Books, Ltd., 1973.
- Montgomery County Public Schools. Instructional Objectives for Media Research and Communication Skills. Suggested Scope and Sequence Chart. Rockville, Maryland, Montgomery County Public Schools, 1975.
- Schwarz, Edith, and others. Instructional Program for Library/Media Centers. U.S. Educational Resources Information Center, ERIC Document ED 114 082, 1975.
- Wisconsin Department of Public Instruction. Learning to Use Media, Bulletin no. 197. Madison, Wisconsin: Wisconsin Department of Public Instruction, Division for Library Services, 1970.