University of Northern Iowa

UNI ScholarWorks

2014

Human trafficking and the media: Comparing newspapers' portrayal of victims and offenders

Brittany Leigh Virkus
University of Northern Iowa

Let us know how access to this document benefits you

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholarworks.uni.edu/etd

Part of the Communication Commons

Recommended Citation

HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND THE MEDIA: COMPARING NEWSPAPERS'
PORTRAYAL OF VICTIMS AND OFFENDERS

An Abstract of a Thesis

Submitted

In Partial Fulfillment

Of the Requirements for the Degree

Master of Arts

Brittany Leigh Virkus

University of Northern Iowa

August 2014

ABSTRACT

This study examined the portrayal of victims and offenders of human trafficking in three major newspapers from 2005- 2012. Additionally, this study examined if the age, gender, and legal status effected the portrayal of victims and offenders in the newspapers. Also included is an examination of groups of claims-makers and whether different groups portrayed victims and offenders same or differently. Utilizing a quantitative and qualitative content analysis to analyze the newspapers' framing of victims and offenders, this research compared the portrayal of its groups. The findings indicated that claims-makers socially construct victims and offenders in ways that may not reflect the true situation. Given such misrepresentation it is imperative that readers and policy makers pay attention to whether or not the claims-makers are expertise in human trafficking.

HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND THE MEDIA: COMPARING NEWSPAPERS'
PORTRAYAL OF VICTIMS AND OFFENDERS

A Thesis

Submitted

In Partial Fulfillment

Of the Requirements for the Degree

Master of Arts

Brittany Leigh Virkus

University of Northern Iowa

August 2014

This study by: Brittany Virkus

Entitled: HUMAN TRAFFICKING AND THE MEDIA: COMPARING

NEWSPAPERS' PORTRAYAL OF VICTIMS AND OFFENDERS

has been approved as meeting the thesis requirement for the

Degree of Master of Arts

_____   _____
Date   Dr. Gayle Rhineberger-Dunn, Chair, Thesis Committee

_____   _____
Date   Dr. Phyllis Baker, Thesis Committee Member

_____   _____
Date   Dr. Richard Featherstone, Thesis Committee Member

_____   _____
Date   Dr. Michael Licari, Dean, Graduate College

DEDICATION

There are numerous people I would like to thank for their help along this journey. Due to space, I cannot list all of these people. I would like to thank my mother, Luanne Virkus as she always been the most supportive person in my life and has always believed I could do anything I wanted to do. She is my role model and has always pushed me to follow my dreams and never give up. I would like to thank my father, Douglas Virkus, for his encouragement, support and for always giving me positive encouragement when I doubted myself. He is like no other father I know. I would like to thank my brother, Travis Virkus, for his continued support and encouragement. I would like to thank my best friend, Kate Terry, for her support and guidance along this journey. Thank you for all positive comments and for always believing in me, you are the true definition of a "best friend." I would also like to thank the rest of my family and friends for their encouragement and support during this entire process.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am greatly indebted, for my chair committee member Dr. Gayle Rhineberger-Dunn who helped guide me through graduate school. Words alone could not thank her enough for all the support, time and dedication she devoted to me. There many times I doubted myself if I could make it through this long process and Dr. Rhineberger-Dunn was always by my side to encourage me along the way. She was not only my professor and chair committee member, but she was my role model and mentor that I admired greatly. She is someone I aspire to be like someday. Dr. Phyllis Baker, I am privileged that you took time out of your busy schedule to serve on my committee. Thank you for all your guidance and help along this journey. Dr. Richard Featherstone, thank you for the continuous support and advice throughout this process. Under this committee's guidance I was able to obtain the knowledge to complete this project, thank you for your commitment and for helping me succeed. Lastly, I would like to thank the Criminology and Sociology faculty members for helping me gain knowledge to be successful in graduate school and afterwards.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Human trafficking is considered to be a relatively new crime to the public.

However, its historical roots can be linked to modern day slavery, meaning it is not a new

social condition (Farrell and Fahy 2009). The United States Government did not consider

human trafficking a federal crime until the year 2000 when Congress passed the

Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA). The TVPA defines human trafficking as

"the illicit enslavement into labor or commercial sex through means of force, fraud, or

coercion" (Farrell and Fahy 2009: 617). The passing of this federal act enhanced public

awareness of human trafficking as a criminal offense, as the media took interest in this

crime (Farrell and Fahy 2009). Prior to 2000, human trafficking had limited range of

coverage in popular media (Farrell and Fahy 2009, Denton 2010, Weitzer 2007). During

the 1990s, the media mostly captured sex trafficking of young white women in their

stories (Farrell and Fahy 2009; Weitzer 2007). After the passing of TVPA, news

coverage and stories in newspapers on human trafficking increased and expanded to

cover labor trafficking and more stories of women minorities as victims (Farrell and Fahy

2009). At the same time, criminological literature's depiction of human trafficking

increased (Bjork 2007; Denton 2010; Farrell and Fahy 2009; Gulati 2008; Weitzer 2007;

Wilson and Dalton 2008).

Media serve as the primary source of human trafficking knowledge, because most

people do not have direct experience with this crime, its offenders, or its victims (Logan

2007). However, there are limited number of academic sources on human trafficking and

newspapers. Instead, a lot of the information about human trafficking and its portrayal in newspapers are from non-academic sources. Human trafficking has appeared to be a widespread problem because people known as claims-makers have taken interest in this particular crime.

An extensive amount of literature exists on the role of the media as claims-makers in constructing reality (Altheide 1997; Barak 1993; Berger and Luckman 1967; Best 1989; Best 1995; Best 1999; Loseke 2003; Surette 2011; Websadale and Alvarez 1998). An essential element of the social constructionist perspective is the role of claims-makers. Claims-makers try to capture the public's attention about social conditions that exist, for the purpose of shaping how individuals view the conditions (Best 1995; Loseke 2003). Claims-makers focus on certain aspects of such conditions that support their perspective on the causes and prevention, ignoring other components of it (Best 1995). Media serving as claims-makers can construct and reinforce myths about crime (Beckett and Sasson 2000; Potter and Kappeler 2006).

Extant research on media and crime reveal that images of both offenders and victims are largely inaccurate (Beard and Payne 2005; Menifield et al. 2001; Oliver and Armstrong 1998; Rhineberger-Dunn, Rader, and Williams 2008; Surette 2011; Websdale and Alvarez 1998). The reason these images are inaccurate is that the media, serving as claims-makers, decide what information they present to the public and how that information is presented, such as deciding what stories to cover (Bailey and Hale 1998; Chermak 1995). Having inaccurate images presented in the media is problematic, as the media helps create "cultural awareness" (Barak 1993) of victims and offenders,

influencing the way we view them (Gerbner and Gross 1976; Goidel, Freeman, and Procopio 2006; Heath and Petraitis 1987), and increases our fear of crime (Altheide 1997; Boulahanis and Heltsley 2004; Chiricos, Eschholz, and Gertz 1997).

While there is extensive research on media and the social construction of crime, few studies have examined the portrayal of both victims and offenders of human trafficking in newspapers. Prior studies on newspapers and human trafficking have examined the ages, gender, and country of origin of victims and offenders (Denton 2010; Wilson and Dalton 2008). However, these studies did not examine who the claim-makers were that portrayed the victims and offenders and whether it was in a positive or negative light. None of the studies on human trafficking and newspapers have examined the portrayal of victims and offenders by analyzing quotes and counting the number of pictures of victims and offenders. One study examined claims-makers that were present in newspapers, but the study did not examine how newspapers portrayed victims and offenders (Gulati 2008). Bjork's (2007) study examined the portrayal of victims in newspapers but, his study did not compare the portrayal of victims to offenders, as my research does.

The dominant claims-makers of human trafficking have consisted of social activist groups, such as women's rights organizations (Gulati 2008; Weitzer 2007). Women and children of human trafficking have been mostly portrayed in the newspapers in a sympathetic manner, whereas men rarely have been identified as victims (Denton 2010; Weitzer 2007).

This results in the public having a distorted image of the condition and what we should do to fix it. Claims-makers create a new "reality" of the phenonium, which influences individual perceptions and behaviors.

It is essential to understand the way newspapers portray human trafficking offenders and victims, as most other images of crime, victims, and offenders are inaccurate (Weitzer 2007). Media play an essential role in socially constructing images of victims and offenders of crimes. These images that the media creates, whether accurate or not, can influence policies being created. Policies are routinely based on the inaccurate images that are presented in the media (Loseke 2003; Surette 2011; Potter and Kappeler 2006; Weitzer 2007). For example, Surette (2011: 192) stated that the three strikes law came into effect after a victim named Polly Klaas was kidnapped and murdered in California. After this incident the media heavily covered crimes about kidnapping regardless, of whether or not more people were victims of this crime (Surette 2011). This crime became symbolic and led to a new policy in California which resulted in criminals receiving a life sentence on their third felony. This is despite the smaller number of victims of both kidnappings and murders that had occurred in California. The Poly Klaas incident led to the implementation of tougher sentences in the California criminal justice system. This is only one example of the power that the media has in shaping people's perception of crime.

The purpose of my research was to extend the literature on human trafficking and newspapers. I examined how stories in three major newspapers portrayed victims and offenders of human trafficking. I focused on who the claims-makers consisted of, and

how their statements portrayed offenders and victims (e.g., positively or negatively).

Further, this research assessed if the positive or negative portrayal of offenders and

victims varied by age, gender and country of origin. If such patterns occur they may

indicate if there false representation of offenders and victims. Additionally, I analyzed if

the claims-makers captured all of the complex dynamics of human trafficking or if they

focused solely on sex trafficking.

   My research also analyzed photos of victims and offenders in these newspapers,

while no other studies on human trafficking and newspapers have analyzed done so. This

is especially important because victims and offenders are depicted positively or

negatively in newspapers through images as well as words (Greer 2007). While the intent

of the study was not to discredit that victims of human trafficking are in need of

assistance, but was to examine how the claims-makers frame human trafficking.

Therefore, my study will present a more accurate image of human trafficking.

   This thesis was organized as follows: Chapter 2, "Theoretical Perspective,"

presents a discussion of the social construction perspective, the empirical research on

media and crime, and the framing literatures. Chapter 3, "Empirical Evidence," reviews

the empirical literature on human trafficking and the media. Chapter 4, "Methods,"

describes how this study examined how human trafficking victims are portrayed in

newspapers compared to offenders. Chapter 5 "Findings," discusses the findings of the

study. Last, Chapter 6, "Discussion," provides an overview of the results in the context of

existing literature, and includes the limitations of the study, recommendations for both future research and policy implications on human trafficking.

CHAPTER 2

THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVE

Chapter 2 provides a discussion of the theoretical framework used to analyze the portrayal of human trafficking in newspapers. The social construction framework is useful to apply to human trafficking because it allows us to understand how this behavior has been socially constructed as a crime. More importantly, though, applying social constructionism can help us better understand how human trafficking victims and offenders are portrayed in the media.

It is important to understand these portrayals, as most people's knowledge of human trafficking comes from what they read or see in the media (Logan 2007). We need to understand the language that media stakeholders use when talking about victims and offenders, as well as who they choose to cite in their stories. The journalist's language and their choice of quotes help shape for the general public a picture of what human trafficking consists of, how extensive it is, who its victims and offenders are, and what we need to do to about it. Understanding how human trafficking victims and offenders are portrayed in the media is important, as prior media and crime literature has established that the media presents distorted images of crime and the actors involved (Beard and Payne 2005; Menifield et al. 2001; Oliver and Armstrong 1998; Rhineberger-Dunn et al. 2008; Surette 2011; Websdale and Alvarez 1998), which affects the public's perception of victims and offenders, attitudes about the actors as the public may gain sympathy and hatred towards certain actors.

Policies are frequently created based on images presented in newspapers, whether these images are accurate or not (Best 1995; Loseke 2003; Sacco 1995). As a result, it is essential to understand how newspapers portray victims compared to offenders as the media is one of the main sources of people's knowledge about human trafficking (Logan 2007). The information gleaned from media sources may impact their support or lack of support for human trafficking policies and laws or their willingness or unwillingness to devote resources (e.g. money and time volunteering) to efforts to prevent human trafficking.

This first section of this chapter presents a general overview of social construction theory. The next section defines social problems and describes the social construction of social problems. The third section defines claims-makers and the roles of the claims-making process in creating awareness of social problems. The fourth section discusses the framing of social problems and how claims-makers use these frames to advance their claims. The fifth section discusses the role of the media in the claims-making process. The last section applies the social constructionist perspective to human trafficking, and sets the outline for understanding the present study on how human trafficking victims are portrayed in newspapers compared to offenders.

Social Construction Theory

One of the main tenants of social construction theory is that the knowledge people have about the world is not objective knowledge (Berger and Luckman 1996; Best 1995; Holstein and Miller 1993; Loseke 2003; Potter and Kappeler 2006; Surette 2011). Knowledge is subjective, based on our interactions with others (Berger and Luckman 1996; Best 1995; Holstein and Miller 1993; Loseke 2003; Potter and Kappeler 2006; Surette 2011). In other words, our reality is socially constructed (Berger and Luckman 1996; Best 1995; Holstein and Miller 1993; Loseke 2003; Potter and Kappeler 2006; Surette 2011). The key for social construction is the meaning we attach to concepts, events and conditions (Berger and Luckman 1996; Best 1995, Holstein and Miller 1993; Loseke 2003; Potter and Kappeler 2006; Surette 2011).We are not born knowing what it means to be attractive/unattractive, healthy/unhealthy, or right/wrong. Rather, we learn through our interactions with others (e.g. parents, teachers, friends, the media) how each of these is defined and what they mean to us (Surette 2011).

For social constructionists, reality is strongly influenced by shifting cultural trends and social forces (Surette 2011). For example, smoking in the 1950s was considered cool and glamorous (Watson, Donovan, and Clarkson 2002), and socially acceptable. People associated smoking with wealth and beauty, and magazine advertisements featured models with cigarettes. However, beginning in the 1970s the cultural meaning of smoking began to change (Watson et al. 2002). The anti-tobacco movement changed the definition of smoking by making the public aware of the health risks caused by smoking cigarettes (Watson et al. 2002). People were no longer seeing

smoking as glamorous; instead they began to associate smoking as hazardous to our health (Watson et al. 2002). The cultural meaning had changed and people who were smoking were now being portrayed as unattractive (Watson et al. 2002). Places where smoking was considered socially acceptable such as bars were now banning the use of tobacco as a result of the shift in cultural trends (Watson et al. 2002).

<u>Defining Social Problems</u>

The primary focus for social constructionists is to understand the process of how a social condition comes to be defined as a social problem (Loseke 2003). In order for a social condition to be defined as a social problem it must meet four criteria (Loseke 2003). First, something must occur that is usually considered wrong by individuals in society (Loseke 2003). Second, there is agreement in society that the condition is a widespread problem, and in need of attention (Loseke 2003). Therefore, the problem must affect more than one person. For example, someone losing their job cannot be considered a social problem because it only affects that particular person (Loseke 2003). However, when local unemployment rates reach a high threshold, then unemployment may become a social problem. Third, optimism is needed, such that people in society believe that they can do something to change or fix the problem (Loseke 2003). For example, individuals in society cannot stop death from occurring (Loseke 2003). However, individuals in society can change when or how someone dies. They can fight to change laws that allow people to have more control over when and how they die (e.g.,

assisted suicide laws, etc.), or that give family members more control over ending life support for a relative (Loseke 2003).

Social problems are not considered to be permanent problems (Loseke 2003). What is defined as a social problem changes over time, with new conditions and behaviors being defined as social problems and replacing other problems that have been fixed or are no longer considered problems that need immediate attention (Loseke 2003). For example, society may focus on terrorism one day, and the next day shift attention to drunk driving (Farrell and Fahy 2009; Loseke 2003). Once laws were passed and programs created to reduce drunk driving, attention and resources were able to shift to a new social problem, one that needed more immediate attention. Loseke (2003) also noted that a condition that is considered to be a social problem usually occurs in a specific context, during a specific time and place, and may at a later date no longer be considered a social problem. For example, during the 1600s in the United States people worried about the problem of witchcraft; however, today people worry about mental illness and are not concerned with witchcraft (Loseke 2003).

Just as what is defined as a social problem changes over time, it also varies across different cultures (Best 1999; Loseke 2003). In the United States, for example, the cause of poor academic performance is likely to be viewed as a personal problem (i.e., individual student laziness or lack of effort) (Loseke 2003). In Japan however, poor academic performance is likely to be viewed as an institutional problem (i.e., lack of school resources or high student to teacher ratio) (Loseke 2003).

Claims-Makers and the Claims-Making Process

The key to understanding how social problems emerge is to determine who is advocating for defining a particular condition as a social problem. Social constructionists call these people or groups claims-makers, and define a claim as an arguable statement made about a social condition (Loseke 2003). Claims-makers are people or organizations that have an interest in a particular social problem and make claims about the condition or the people impacted by the condition (Loseke 2003). The primary role of a claims-maker is to raise enough attention, outrage and/or fear about a social condition that others begin to see it as a social problem (Best 1999). Claims-makers are known to exaggerate the statistics associated with the condition about which they are making claims. Tuchman (1978) described the claims-making process as "relocating facticity" (Tuchman 1978). For example, "when a reporter writes 'Expert A said X, 'this sentence is true, as long as Expert A did say X; it makes no difference whether X happens to be false" (Best 1989:22). Claims-makers also attempt to gain support from other organizations or people for the purpose of having them make claims so that more people are aware of the condition (Best 1999). Additionally, Claims-makers will use the media to gain more attention from the public for the purpose of having people recognize the condition as a social problem (Best 1995).

Anyone can become a claims-maker, but certain people have a higher degree of credibility and become more successful at claims-making. The public views scientists as the top claims-makers because they have higher credibility as a result of their education and occupational prestige (Best 1995; Loseke 2003; Spector and Kitsuse 2001). As a

result, the public is more likely to trust scientists' claims compared to claims made by ordinary people with less credibility. Social activist organizations are more likely than some groups to capture the public's attention and be more successful at claims-making because they tend to have a large membership and greater resources (Best 1995; Loseke 2003). For example, the National Rifle Association and the United Auto Workers Labor Union, are both more successful as claims-makers than other similar organizations, because they represent a large number of people nationwide, and have high-profile or celebrity representatives. People who have been through a tragic accident can also become successful claims-makers through their work as social activists. For example, the group known as Mothers Against Drunk Driving (MADD) started after a mother lost her child in a car accident because of a drunk driver (Loseke 2003). She and her daughter became the public face of a social movement advocating for tougher laws and other measures to prevent drunk driving.

Just because claims-makers are successful at advocating their claims and having a condition defined as a social problem, does not mean that they have expertise in the field about which they are making claims (Best 1999). Frequently, people make claims whether they have expertise in a specific field or not, and sometimes the public is unaware of the fact that these people are not experts and that they lack credibility. Social scientists are experts in specific fields, but their occupational status gives them more social status, and they are able to successfully make claims about topics outside of their specific expertise. Similarly, some claims-makers might have a great deal of expertise in

a specific field, but the public may ignore or discredit their claims because they do not have a credible title behind their name (Loseke 2003).

Additionally, people who are in the middle and upper classes have more status and power, and as a result are able to obtain more resources, such as the media, to make their problems appear more widespread and in need of immediate attention (Best 1995). Lower class and minority individuals are generally considered to have low credibility, and as a result they cannot gain the attention of the media (Adoni 1984). These individuals may try to bring attention to a particular social condition, but they are discredited because of their race and class status. This results in people from higher economic and social statuses, particularly politicians, ignoring their claims, leading to policies that neglect lower class and minority perspectives on social conditions (Adoni 1984).

<u>Types of Claims</u>

There are three main types of claims that claims-makers use to bring attention to a particular condition or event. The first types of claims are verbal claims, where claims-makers try to construct meaning of a condition through words. For example, lawyers argue their side to the court-room by making verbal claims (Loseke 2003). Claims-makers in newspapers make verbal claims about victims and offenders, such as demeaning them through words such as evil or innocent. The general public, who often lacks expert knowledge about victims and offenders, then makes erroneous assumptions about the nature of certain crimes, victims, and offenders.

The second common type of claim that claims-makers use are visual claims. Visual claims attract attention, and the media are prominent claims-makers in this process, such as displaying pictures of victims on the front page of the newspaper for the purpose of making readers feel sympathy for that particular victim or victims, and feel more hatred toward the offender (Bailey and Hale 1998; Best 1999). This may in turn result in changes to laws that reflect harsher punishments for these types of offenders.

The third common type of claim that claims-makers use are behavioral claims. A behavioral claim "is where the social problems work involves doing something or creating a visual picture of something" (Loseke 2003:26). Behavioral claims are also effective for claims-makers in trying to capture the publics' attention to have their claim noticed and the media as a claims-maker can decide what images of victims and offenders to display within the newspaper. For example, journalists may choose to display images of victims of labor trafficking within the newspapers who are carrying signs to protest unfair treatment. Therefore, when claims-makers choose to display these images of victims within the newspapers it results in the public viewing them in a sympathetic manner.

Claims-makers also want their problem to appear important and worthy of attention and resources (Best 1989; Best 1995; Loseke 2003; Spector and Kitsuse 2001). Claims-makers are always competing with one another for resources, such as media attention, money, volunteers, and political attention. In order to gain more resources, and make their claims seem more important, claims-makers are likely to focus on only one aspect of a problem. For example, the people who are outraged over the possibility of

legalized marijuana may focus on how the drug affects people's memory. Other groups of claims-makers who favor legalizing marijuana will focus on the positive health effects of marijuana usage, such as helping cancer patients or patients who are suffering severe pain

<u>Claims-Making and Framing</u>

Claims-makers use frames to shape how we view a social problem (Loseke 2003; Johnston and Noakes 2005; Snow and Benford 1998). A frame "at its most basic, identifies a problem that is social or political in nature, the parties responsible for causing the problem, and a solution" (Johnston and Noakes 2005:5). A social problems frame helps to give meaning to different facts constructed around us. Thus, without framing, the claims only identify the facts of the problem, such as the number of victims, how much harm it created, and the condition of the problem. There are several different types of frames that claims-makers use in identifying social problems, including diagnostic, piggybacking, domain expansion, master frames, taken-for granted, motivational and prognostic frames (Best 1995).

Claims-makers use diagnostic frames to help give meaning to different social conditions. Snow and Benford (2000:5) stated that "diagnostic framing presents to potential recruits a new interpretation of issues or events; like a medical diagnosis, it tells what is wrong and why." Diagnostic frames construct people or institutions as the cause of the problem and encourage people to feel abhorrence towards these people and blame them for the underlying problem. Claims-makers use diagnostic frames to help construct

crime and its' victims and offenders, which helps the public understand the underlying problem of how and why the victims and offenders committed the crime. Claims-makers can place blame on someone besides the offender or victim. For example, "the villain came from a dysfunctional family or bad neighborhood, and as a result blame is deflected from the person who committed the crime and is shifted towards the family and neighborhood" (Loseke 2003:100). Claims-makers use frames so the public will view certain victims or offenders in a positive or negative light.

Similarly, the medicalized diagnostic frame constructs the person as the cause of the problem, but it releases them from responsibility and blame for the problem (Loseke 2003; Snow and Benford 2000). For example, alcoholism today is mostly constructed as a disease, and people who have it are not responsible for it (Loseke 2003). As a result, the medicalized diagnostic frame constructs the persons' actions as the result of the disease not a result of their personal choice. It diminishes the blame from the person and shifts fault on their heredity. However, over time the medicalized diagnostic frames can change. Before alcoholism was constructed as a disease and treated as a medical condition, it was previously constructed as a sin in which the person was constructed as a weak person who made bad choices. Within this earlier construction, alcoholics were choosing to drink so they were the ones to blame for the problem and could be punished as a result.

Claims-makers also try to connect different social problems together, a tactic known as piggybacking (Best 1989; Best 1995; Loseke 2003). Claims-makers want people to understand the claims they are making, and take the same stance as them.

Therefore claims-makers will link similar conditions together that have already been defined as social problems; if people are already familiar with the condition they are more likely to accept the condition as a social problem (Snow and Benford 2000; Best 1989; Best 1999; Loseke 2003; Johnston and Noakes 2005). For example, "posttraumatic stress" disorder originated as being classified as a psychological problem that was created from having been in military combat; but therapists later applied "traumatic stresses" to include other conditions such as crime victimization and rape (Best 1999). Piggybacking and domain expansion help claims-makers retain fresh ideas so people do not lose interest. People are more likely to accept conditions as social problems if they are already familiar with some aspects of it (Best 1999). This, then, helps advance new social problems because people are more likely to view similar or related conditions as a social problem in need of attention (Best 1999).

Rational expansion is similar to domain expansion. It "offers advocates a way of keeping their claims fresh and to hold their current supporters' attention, while simultaneously trying to increase their own influence by attracting more adherents" (Best 1999: 175). For example, a movement called Farm Animal Reform (FARM) supported animal rights and opposed factory farming (Best 1999). However, when the group discovered that not many people were concerned with the rights of farm animals, they started a process of rational expansion; they made additional claims, trying to persuade more people into supporting their group. They did this by claiming that eating factory meat can cause harm to people's health (Best 1999). They hoped these new claims would reduce the incidence of people eating factory meat.

Master frames are also important in understanding social problems. "Master frames are broad orientations shared by diverse movements and they reveal links among parallel movements" (Best 1999: 177). For example, "equal rights" has remained a master frame for several different groups, such as racial and ethnic minorities, gays and lesbians, women and the disabled. Social movements use master frames when groups cannot have ideological agreement because they consist of more than one group. Master frames are also helpful when claims-makers try and bring attention to a new social problem. If an issue has already received attention in the media, such as with equal rights, claims-makers will link this to a new social problem and people are more likely to accept the claim and solution if they are already familiar with a similar problem (Loseke 2003).

Social problem ownership in framing "happens when one particular social problem diagnostic frame becomes the taken-for-granted frame for the problem" (Loseke 2003:69). Claims-makers will try to use the taken-for-granted frame and construct the frame so they have the highest credibility. Claims-makers attempt to gain ownership of a problem, resulting in different frames that could have become constructed differently or other frames becoming ignored. For example, the social group Mothers Against Drunk Driving (MADD), claims-makers could have constructed the problem of drunk driving as a structural condition (e.g. roads or alcohol) or an individual (e.g. choice or problem) condition, people who choose to drink and drive (Loseke 2003). The MADD claims-makers could have made claims that not having enough public transportation results in more people getting behind the wheel when they are intoxicated. Instead these mothers decided to construct the problem as "drunk driving," where the individuals who choose to

drink and drive are the cause of the problem. Thus, more audience members are likely to accept these claims because MADD has taken ownership of the underlying cause of the problem being a choice. As a result people are familiar with the cause and solutions to the problem. The public is less likely to view the problem of drunk driving as a structural problem, because no claims-makers have been successful in constructing it this way. People have not heard, for example, claims-makers blaming the alcohol distributors for causing an increase in drunk driving rates as a result of the easy access to liquor. Because MADD was successful in constructing drunk driving as a personal choice, policies were created to have tougher punishment for those who drink and drive (Loseke 2003).

Motivational framing is also an essential type of framing that claims-makers use to persuade audience members through logic and emotions. Motivational framing "provides a call to arms or rationale for engaging in ameliorative collective action, including the construction of appropriate vocabularies or motive" (Snow and Benford 2000:617). Motivational framing uses language that emphasizes significance and urgency about the social problem (Snow and Benford 2000). For example, claims-makers of human trafficking have used words such as evil and cruel to describe the offenders of human trafficking, which is likely to lead the public to view this crime in a more negative manner and develop hatred towards this crime and its offenders (Weitzer 2007). Social activist claims-makers frequently use motivational framing to help the public feel sympathy towards victims and hatred towards certain offenders (Best 1995; Loseke 2003). For example, Mothers Against Drunk Driving (MADD) often uses personal experiences by describing positive characteristics of children who were victims of drunk

driving, such as being young, innocent and intelligent. Therefore, this type of framing is more likely to lead to people having more positive feelings about the victims, and more hatred towards the offenders.

Prognostic framing presents a solution to the problem that has been diagnosed (Snow and Benford 1998). Prognostic framing focuses on the need for people to take action to fix a problem. The solution to the problem should resolve the harm that was caused because of the condition. However, there can be conflicting cultural themes about how to solve a particular social problem (Loseke 2003). For example, some claims-makers argue that people are homeless because of the lack of shelters then the solution should match the problem, meaning more shelters should be built (Loseke 2003). Other claims-makers connect homelessness with mental illnesses. So if people are homeless and living on the streets because of mental illnesses, then the solution to homelessness should be to provide help for the mentally ill (Loseke 2003).

Claims-Making and the Media

Loseke (2003) argued that the media becomes essential for claims-makers for three different reasons. First, the media reaches a large audience, which may result in more people joining the cause (Loseke 2003). Second, the media are primary sources of knowledge for most people about social problems, as most people do not experience these things directly (Loseke 2003). Third, ideas present in the media can influence how individuals view social problems (Loseke 2003). For example, individuals who watch

television shows about crime tend to fear crime more than individuals who do not watch these shows (Bailey and Hale 1998).

Claims-makers compete for the attention of the media so their claims can be heard (Best 1995). However, reporters and editors also decide what claims-makers can be heard in the media. They do this not only by choosing the stories they cover, but also by choosing whom to cite as sources in their coverage of the story. A vast number of stories come through the newsroom about crime from criminal justice agencies, particularly the police (Bailey and Hale 1998; Chermak 1995). Police often participate as sources for news media because they value having a good image in the media. As a result, police often become a primary claims-maker in the newspaper because news reporters have a close working relationship with them.

Loseke (2003) argued that claims-makers frequently use the media to make their claims heard by a large audience, but that individuals representing media outlets can themselves become claims-makers. Loseke (2003) argued that individuals who work for the media become centralized in the claims-making process in two different ways. First, individuals who work for media agencies can become primary claims-makers. A primary claims-maker is someone who makes claims themselves, and does not re-state claims that were made by someone else (Loseke 2003). An example of a primary claims-maker would be a news reporter who searches for stories and constructs social problems themselves. For example, a reporter covers the case of embezzlement at a local bank, and discusses how they were personally impacted by the scheme. As part of their reporting, they may advocate for change, proclaiming that something needs to be done to stop these

types of crimes. However, if the reporter is not a victim, but interviews the victims or offenders in order to develop a story about embezzlement, then s/he would no longer be a primary source, but they would still be a claims-maker. News reporters usually only become primary claims-makers when they are gathering the information first hand and are not interviewing other people (Best 1995; Surette 2011).

In summary, this chapter has focused on describing the main tenants of social construction theory, the process of how a social condition comes to be defined as a social problem, the role of claims-makers (and their types of claims and how they use claims and framing to advance their claims), and lastly the role of the media in the claims-making process. I turn next to a discussion of how social constructionism can be used to better understand the crime of human trafficking.

<center>Human Trafficking</center>

Human trafficking is not considered to be a new social problem, but rather has its roots in slavery (Weitzer 2007). Prior to the 1990s, the issue of human trafficking was not discussed publically, but by the mid-1990s, claims-makers were discussing it as a human rights problem (Farrell and Fahy 2009). Newspapers began to focus predominately on female victims, as a result of the human rights frame, but news neglected to cover male victims, and virtually ignored labor trafficking victims (Farrell and Fahy 2009). Similar to white slavery, where white women became viewed as being innocent and pure, the young White girls' stories evoked sympathy from the public and government (Farrell and Fahy 2009), leading human trafficking to be defined as a social problem.

Additionally, during this time, human trafficking was portrayed broadly as sex trafficking, indicating that force needed to be used for an individual to be considered a victim of human trafficking. The definition at this time did not include any other forms of trafficking. However, many organizations, such as feminist, Christian, women's human rights and early abolitionist groups were dissatisfied with this broad definition. They then fought to expand the definition, joining with civil rights attorneys and labor rights organizations, to have more support for their claim that the definition should be expanded. The definition expanded in 2000 to include labor trafficking, resulting in the media covering more stories on it.

More recently, the public has become more aware of human trafficking, both sex and labor trafficking, due to particular claims-makers, such as non-profit organizations, bringing the condition to the attention of the media and public (Denton 2010; Weitzer 2007). Women's Rights Groups have recently been prominent claims-makers, making the condition of human trafficking known to the public, leading other organizations such as Equal Rights Groups, in joining them to make the public aware of the condition of human trafficking (Farrell and Fahy 2009; Weitzer 2007). Claims-makers of human trafficking also have people of high social status joining them in advocating about human trafficking. For example, celebrities such as Demi Moore have joined the human trafficking campaign in promoting awareness of this condition. Additionally, celebrities such as Demi Moore have used the media to bring more attention to human trafficking through advocating in commercials. Yet there are still a limited number of claims-makers

who have taken ownership in promoting the need for others to help join and support victims of human trafficking (Weitzer 2007).

Although human trafficking itself is not new, claims-makers have used the media to make human trafficking appear more widespread, problematic, and in need of immediate attention (Best 1999; Loseke 2003). In order to make their claims seem more important, most claims-makers have focused on one aspect of the problem, framing human trafficking as a problem that primarily affects women and children as victims of evil male offenders (Denton 2010; Weitzer 2007). These claims-makers have used prognostic framing in presenting the solution to the problem, meaning policies should focus on helping women and children. However, this is problematic as other victims will be ignored such as men and they will not receive the same benefits if policies only reflect particular victims.

The purpose of this thesis was to discuss more specific aspects of how human trafficking is constructed in the media. Specifically, I examined how claims-makers socially construct victims and offenders of human trafficking in newspapers, by examining who the claims-makers were and the type of framing they use to construct human trafficking victims in a negative or positive manner. I turn next to discuss the existing literature on how human trafficking is portrayed in newspapers.

CHAPTER 3

EMPIRICAL EVIDENCE

Chapter 3 provides a review of the empirical literature on human trafficking and the media. A great deal of academic literature exists on human trafficking, ranging from policy analyses to programs for human trafficking victims. However, most of this literature is not relevant to this thesis, as its purpose is to examine how newspapers socially construct victims of human trafficking compared to offenders. Information in this chapter focused specifically on the empirical literature that analyzes how human trafficking is portrayed in newspapers.

Bjork (2007) conducted a quantitative content analysis of human trafficking in Vietnam. Bjork's objective was to examine how newspapers portrayed illegal immigrant victims of human trafficking in the local newspapers. His purpose for focusing on illegal immigrant victims of human trafficking was to examine if these newspapers vilified them in the local newspapers. Bjork (2007) examined two different newspapers: *The Bangkok Post* and *The Nation* in Thailand from July 2004 to June 2007. Bjork (2007) choose these two newspapers because they are considered the most influential papers in the sub-regional area, and their typical readers included business leaders, policy leaders, and academics. He chose a three year time period to allow for a general overview of these newspapers' coverage of human trafficking and migration and he believed this time frame would allow for enough time to distinguish changes in the newspapers' coverage of human trafficking and migration.

Bjork (2007) first analyzed the gender and age of illegal immigrant victims of human trafficking in these two newspapers. The purpose of determining the gender of illegal victims of human trafficking in the local newspapers was to help identify if male or female victims were given more of a voice in these articles. Bjork was able to identify the gender of illegal immigrant victims of human trafficking in 311 of the 648 articles. Of the 311 articles that identified the gender of the victims, Bjork (2007) found that illegal immigrant male victims of human trafficking were discussed in 33 (11 percent) of the articles in the local newspapers, while illegal female immigrant victims were discussed in 141 (45 percent) articles. In the remaining 137 articles (44 percent), both male and female illegal victims of human trafficking were discussed. Clearly female victims of human trafficking were the dominant voice in the newspapers.

Bjork (2007) also examined the age of illegal immigrant victims of human trafficking from the local area. Of the 648 articles, 282 of the articles identified the victims' ages. Of these 282 articles, 46 (16 percent) discussed illegal immigrant adult victims, and 149 (52 percent) articles discussed children as victims. The remaining 87 (31 percent) articles discussed both illegal immigrant adults and children as victims.

Bjork (2007) also examined the type of human trafficking discussed in relation to illegal immigrant victims. Although he identified 648 articles on human trafficking, he was only able to identify the type of human trafficking being discussed in 181 (30 percent) of the articles. Bjork's analysis revealed that the majority of articles focused on

labor trafficking. His research revealed that 124 (68 percent) of the 181 articles discussed labor trafficking. Of these 181 articles, 32 (18 percent) focused on sex trafficking, and 25 (14 percent) discussed cases of both sex and labor trafficking.

Bjork's (2007) primary focus was to analyze how *The Bangkok Post* and *The Nation* portrayed the character of illegal immigrant victims of human trafficking. His codebook consisted of three questions to assess how victims of human trafficking were portrayed. Bjork first examined if the victims were being portrayed as innocent victims, evil villains, or both (Bjork 2007). Bjork determined that if the reporter used sympathetic language when discussing the victim, then the individual was being portrayed as an innocent victim and not as contributing to their victimization. Conversely, if the reporter wrote about the individual in a non-sympathetic way, the individual was being portrayed as a villain. For example, if the article discussed the victim as being both an offender and victim, they were portrayed in a non-sympathetic manner. The second question examined whether individuals received help from authorities. For example, if the victims received assistance from authorities such as help obtaining visas, they were portrayed in a positive manner in the newspapers compared to victims who did not receive assistance.

The last question in the codebook analyzed if the reporter's language was sympathetic towards the victim who was being exploited. For example, if the reporter placed blame on someone other than the victim, such as the offender, then the victim was portrayed as sympathetic. On the other hand, if the article did not discuss someone else besides the victim being blamed for the victimization then they were being portrayed in a non-sympathetic manner in the newspaper, meaning they were portrayed as not deserving

the status of a true victim. Bjork's (2007) findings also revealed that newspapers portrayed approximately half of the exploited individuals as innocent victims, suggesting that these victims should receive assistance and/or other resources. The findings also revealed that between 5 and 10 percent of the victims in the articles were presented "as both victims and villains" (Bjork 2007:40). For example, victims were portrayed as both a victim and villain if they were a victim, but also an offender. The analysis revealed that, overall, newspapers presented a sympathetic view of illegal immigrant victims of human trafficking, such that they were portrayed as innocent and deserving of help from others.

In summary, Bjork's (2007) research revealed that illegal immigrant females and child victims of human trafficking were more likely to be portrayed in newspapers than males and adults. Illegal male immigrant victims of human trafficking were rarely recognized as victims, even though in reality there are male victims of labor and sex trafficking. This portrayal may lead readers to assume that the majority of illegal human trafficking victims are primarily young females. This may lead them to be more likely to support policies that relate to female victims rather than male victims.

Logan (2007) conducted a qualitative study of 140 experts and non-experts on human trafficking. The purpose of this study was to examine how much direct experience people have with the crime of human trafficking, and to determine the source from which the public receives their information about human trafficking. Experts were identified as people "across the state known to have interest, knowledge, and/or actual experience with

human trafficking cases in Kentucky" (Logan 2007:12). This included people in human service agencies (i.e., health care providers) and in the criminal justice field (law enforcement officials and lawyers).

According to Logan (2007), non-experts were identified as individuals who had not been directly involved in a case dealing with human trafficking, and included directors of rape crisis centers and domestic violence shelters. The participants were asked about where they obtained their knowledge on human trafficking. Answer choices were "from clients, co-workers, family and friends, or personal stories from others; through the media including television, the internet, news reports, articles, or other reports; and trainings or conferences" (Logan 2007:36). They were asked to check all that apply from this list.

Logan's (2007) findings revealed that the two common sources of information about human trafficking were personal knowledge (e.g., through friends, clients or co-workers) and the media. For experts, the most common source was personal knowledge, with 69 percent of experts indicating that they received their information about human trafficking from personal knowledge. The second most common source of information for experts was the media, with 41 percent of respondents indicating that the media was also one of their sources of information about human trafficking.

The results were reversed for non-experts, where the most common source of information about human trafficking was the media. Nearly 55 percent of non-experts indicated that their information about human trafficking comes from the media. Personal

knowledge was the second most common source, with 41 percent of non-experts indicating their information on human trafficking comes from personal knowledge.

A third common source of information on human trafficking for both experts and non-experts was trainings/conferences. Fifty-six percent of experts and 38 percent of non-experts indicated that they received human trafficking information from trainings/conferences. Lastly, the survey indicated that experts received their knowledge about human trafficking from other service providers 33 percent of the time, and non-experts utilized this source 25 percent of the time.

Logan's study revealed that the media is one of the primary sources of information on human trafficking, for both experts and non-experts. This underscores the need to study how human trafficking and its' victims and offenders are portrayed in the media. If these images are inaccurate, and if both experts and non-experts are relying on these images as a primary source of information, it is quite possible that ineffective policies and other negative social consequences will occur.

Weitzer (2007) also conducted a study on the portrayal of human trafficking in the media. He used a social constructionist perspective to examine the core claims that have been made in anti-trafficking campaigns and how these claims affect policies that are implemented in the United States. Specifically, Weitzer used stages three and four of the social construction perspective to analyze how claims-makers have utilized the media to make their claims about sex trafficking and prostitution. Stage 3 of the social constructionist perspective is when claims-makers have framed the social problem to help

draw attention to the public of the issue (Weitzer 2007). Stage four of the theory is when

policies are implemented as a result of the redefining of the social problem (Weitzer

2007).

Weitzer (2007) found that, consistent with stage 3 of the social construction

perspective, conservative groups argued that prostitution and sex trafficking is a threat to

families of the victim, that it is essentially evil. This group tends to discredit the victims

while giving sympathy towards the family. Abolitionist feminists, however, argued that

all prostitution and sex trafficking exploits women whether they consent or not, and it

affects all women regardless of their nationality.

Weitzer (2007) also found that, consistent with social constructionism, that each

group had differential solutions for the problem based on the claims they originally made

about prostitution and sex trafficking. For example, conservative groups have argued for

policies that help assist the victim's family. Abolitionist feminists, however, have

proposed harsher punishments for offenders in order to protect all women from these

criminals.

Weitzer's study also revealed that the majority of the claims-makers who have

made claims about human trafficking represent various women's organizations. He

argued that having limited viewpoints presented in the media is problematic as it will

likely lead to an inaccurate portrayal of human trafficking and the victims of this crime.

Claims-makers frame human trafficking in a particular light in order to garner resources,

such as the media, financial, and political support. Successfully obtaining these resources

may result in policies that are shaped by just one perspective of the problem. If only a

limited number of claims-makers are heard within the media, it will result in the public advocating for policies based on inaccurate information (Weitzer 2007). These policies may in turn be ineffective or result in more negative consequences.

Wilson and Dalton (2008) also studied how newspapers portray the crime of human trafficking. Specifically, they focused on the extent to which cases of human trafficking were covered in Toledo and Columbus, Ohio, newspapers, and the manner in which articles portrayed both the victims and the offenders. They were particularly interested in Toledo and Columbus, as both cities have been identified as central locations for human trafficking.

Wilson and Dalton (2008) analyzed online articles from *The Columbus Dispatch* and *The Toledo Blade* between January 1, 2003 and June 30, 2006. The starting date of 2003 allowed for a time delay after the passing of Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) in 2000. They believed that newspapers might increase their coverage of human trafficking right after the passage of the law, and they wanted to develop a more accurate picture of the typical coverage of human trafficking in these newspapers. They focused solely on articles that covered a specific or identifiable case of human trafficking in these cities. While there were 15 cases in Toledo and Columbus, Ohio, during this time frame, only four cases were discussed in these newspapers.

Wilson and Dalton's newspaper analysis revealed that although they could not identify the sex of some victims, of those that were identified, all four newspapers covered cases of female victims. These newspapers did not identify any cases involving male victims. In addition, all the females discussed in the articles were between the ages

of 10 and 17. They also found that the newspapers discussed the victims being mostly

from Toledo.

In addition to analyzing the victims' portrayal in the newspapers, Wilson and

Dalton (2008) analyzed how offenders were portrayed. They found that the newspapers

discussed cases where there was both a male and female offender. However, Wilson and

Dalton (2008) did not specify how many of the offenders were males and how many were

females. The articles also discussed the age of the offenders. Male offenders in these

cases were portrayed as mostly between the ages of 22 to 43 and female offenders were

between 19 and 27.

Wilson and Dalton (2008) also interviewed criminal justice and social service

providers in Columbus and Toledo, Ohio. Their purpose was to assess differences

between the four cases appearing in newspapers and the 15 cases that were reported to

law enforcement between January 1, 2003 and June 30, 2006. The criminal justice

agencies consisted of local and federal law enforcement agencies, probation officers,

prosecutors, probation officers and secure placement directors. Social service providers

included healthcare providers, sexual assault recovery service providers, immigrant

service providers, prostitution recovery service providers and behavioral health service

agencies.

Interviews with the law enforcement officials revealed that the majority of sex

trafficking cases have young victims. Law enforcement agencies also revealed that some

of the girls viewed prostitution as a glamorous job. Interviews with respondents from

Columbus, Ohio, revealed that juvenile victims of human trafficking were frequently treated as offenders rather than victims, and were instead prosecuted for a similar offense.

On the other hand, interviews with the law enforcement officials revealed that in Toledo only 2 out of the 4 cases presented in the newspapers discussed the victims being abducted by the offender. They mentioned that some of the offenders were prominent figures in the community, such as doctors and business people. Wilson and Dalton (2008) noted newspapers rarely discussed these offenders and their elite status in the community. However, one of the four cases in the newspapers discussed the status of the offender and he was a well-respected doctor in the community. On the other hand, interviews with law enforcement officials revealed that 4 of the 15 cases involved labor trafficking, and all 4 cases discussed offenders with elite statuses such as doctors in the community.

In summary, Wilson and Dalton's (2008) study revealed that these two newspapers portrayed a very narrow view of human trafficking victims and offenders. Interviews revealed that there were some male victims of human trafficking in the 15 cases reported to law enforcement. However, newspapers only portrayed victims as young females, effectively ignoring male victims. Their study also revealed that these newspapers only focused on juveniles as victims and adults as offenders. However, Wilson and Dalton's (2008) interviews revealed that there were in fact a few adult victims in the 15 cases that were reported to law enforcement. They concluded that while these local newspapers portray the victims and offenders in a particular manner it was not always accurate when compared to all reported cases of human trafficking.

Gulati (2008) also conducted a content analysis of how human trafficking is portrayed in the media. His objective was to examine the types of claims-makers who were represented in newspaper articles discussing human trafficking. Gulati (2008) collected articles from *The Washington Post*, *The New York Times*, *The Times of London*, *The Guardian*, *The Toronto Star* and Canada's *Globe* and *Mail*. He selected these four papers because they all have a large audience. Articles on human trafficking were collected from January 1, 2005 to December 31, 2005. He selected the year 2005 because it allowed enough time for policymakers to comment on the human trafficking cases after the passage of the TVPA in 2000.

Gulati (2008) chose the online database Lexis-Nexis to search for articles on human trafficking in the six study newspapers, as it contains articles in print and allows for a full-text review of the articles. He analyzed 169 articles on human trafficking for the year-long study, omitting duplicate articles. Articles included editorials, full-length news stories, signed commentaries, news summaries and lists, and letters to the editor.

Gulati (2008) examined the sources cited throughout these newspapers, to see which claims-makers and their associated viewpoints were represented the most. His research revealed that policies on human trafficking have been largely shaped by a small number of claims-makers with limited viewpoints. Only one source was referenced in 30 percent of the articles, while 32 percent of the articles referenced at least two sources. His findings revealed that newspapers largely ignored academics, with only 7 percent of the articles citing claims made by academics. Gulati (2008) also found victims were also largely ignored and were only cited in 10 percent of the articles. Only 16 percent of the

169 articles cited law enforcement representatives as sources. Further, Gulati (2008) found that the most common claims-maker cited in these newspaper articles were government representatives and policy makers, who were cited in 33 percent of the articles. The National Global Organization was the second most dominant claims-maker, and was cited in 25 percent of the articles. Additionally, Gulati (2008) found that these newspapers virtually ignored witnesses, victims, and victim advocates, as none of these groups were cited as direct sources.

In summary, Gulati's (2008) research supports the idea that newspaper reporters rely on a limited number of courses, and that these sources have a clear and specific purpose when making claims that are cited in newspaper articles. Government representatives and policy makers, who may not have well-rounded or extensive knowledge of human trafficking, were cited more frequently than academics, who are experts in the field.

Farrell and Fahy (2009) analyzed how human trafficking is framed in newspaper articles and how the social problem of human trafficking has changed over time. Using Lexis-Nexis, they analyzed U.S. newspapers from 1990 to 2006, and found a total of 2,462 articles on a wide range of issues related to federal, state, and international cases of human trafficking. They then ran an ordinary least squares regression analysis to identify specific times and events that could help to explain the changes in the framing of human trafficking over time.

Farrell and Fahy (2009) used Spector and Kitsuse's (1973) model of social problems to analyze framing of human trafficking. According to Spector and Kitsuse

(1973), four stages become present during the history of social problems. The four stages include: "(1) groups claim and publicize a problem, (2) officials respond to the problem, (3) new claims emerge in response to dissatisfaction with official responses, and (4) new institutions are established" (Spector and Kitsuse 1973:78).

The ordinary least squares regression analysis revealed that stage one took place between 1990 and 1999. Stage one focuses on when group(s) and/or organization(s) claim a problem exists in society that they did not previously view as a concern. During this stage people agree a problem exists. Prior to the 1990s, the issue of human trafficking was not discussed publically. Farrell and Fahy's (2009) findings revealed that during the mid-1990s, society viewed human trafficking as a human rights problem. Newspapers began to focus predominately on female victims, as a result of the human rights frame, but the news neglected to cover male victims, and virtually ignored labor trafficking victims. Similar to white slavery, where white women became viewed as being innocent and pure, the young white girls' stories evoked sympathy from the public and government (Farrell and Fahy 2009), leading human trafficking being defined as social problem.

Farrell and Fahy (2009) also ran an ordinary least squares regression for stage two and the analysis revealed that this time period occurred between 2000-2002. This stage occurs when organizations or individuals identify a social problem and attempt to fix the underlying problem. Sex trafficking was broadly defined by the Clinton Administration in the 1990s, indicating that force needed to be used for an individual to be considered a victim of human trafficking. The definition at this time did not include any other forms of

trafficking. However, many organizations, such as feminist, Christian, women's rights, human rights and early abolitionist groups were dissatisfied with this broad definition. They then fought to expand the definition, joining with civil rights attorneys and labor rights organizations, to have more support for their claim that the definition should be expanded. The definition expanded in 2000 to include labor trafficking, resulting in the media covering more stories on it.

The ordinary least squares regression analysis also revealed that stage three of Spector and Kitsuse's (1973) model on social problems took place between 2003 and 2006. Stage 3 of Spector and Kitsuse's (1973) model is when groups become dissatisfied with how people have responded to the problem. Stage four of their model, results in new institutions being created because of the dissatisfaction, such as creating new policies. However, Farrell and Fahy (2009) found two stages, when applied to human trafficking, did not occur in order. Spector and Kitsuse (1973) "suggest when problems receive inadequate responses they are redefined and new institutions emerge in response to this change" (Spector and Kitsuse 1973:73). However, they found that from 2003 to 2006 policy makers framed human trafficking as a national security problem in response to September 11, 2001. They found that as result of the reframing of this as a national security problem, new polices were implemented to assist victims who were willing to work with law enforcement, and prosecute offenders of human trafficking as terrorists. Farrell and Fahy (2009) found in their study, "public framing in human trafficking shifted from a human rights problem in the 1990s to predominately crime and criminal justice problem at the turn of the century" (Farrell and Fahy 2009: 623).

Farrell and Fahy's (2009) analysis revealed that some claims-makers were very successful at advocating for human trafficking to be recognized as a social problem. Successful claims-makers were able to use the media to advocate for changing the definition of human trafficking, as well as for advancing new policy initiatives to better assist victims and more effectively prosecute and punish offenders.

Denton (2010) also conducted a quantitative content analysis on newspapers similar to Wilson and Dalton's (2008) study, focusing on how newspapers frame human trafficking. Denton's (2010) study was concerned with how newspapers influence social movements and how individuals in organizations utilize newspapers in order to draw attention to their social problem. Denton (2010) used cases of human trafficking to convey that newspaper journalists, as claims-makers, have only focused on particular aspects of this crime.

Using Google News Archive, a database that includes both national and international newspapers, Denton (2010) searched for all articles discussing human trafficking between January 1 and June 30, 2007. She chose this time frame because her search in Google News Archive revealed that it had the highest number of articles on human trafficking compared to any other time frame.

Denton's (2010) study revealed that while newspapers discussed both male and female victims of human trafficking, women and children were more frequently discussed than male victims. Of the 191 articles, 108 revealed the gender and age of the victims. Adult victims were discussed in 85 (80 percent) of the 108 articles where gender and age could be determined. Adult female victims were discussed in 70 (82 percent) of

the 85 articles, and 15 (18 percent) discussed adult male victims. Denton's study also revealed that there were 21 (20 percent) cases that discussed children in the articles. In addition, 13 of the 22 (59 percent) cases were about female children victims. While 9 (41 percent) articles involved children of both genders, in which the article discussed the victims as being trafficked together.

Denton's (2010) findings also revealed that both males and females were portrayed as offenders of human trafficking, and were often portrayed as working together. A total of 58 (42 percent) articles portrayed men and women as offenders participating in trafficking together. Additionally, male offenders were discussed more frequently than female offenders. A total of 68 (49 percent) articles portrayed only men as offenders, while only 12 (9 percent) articles portrayed women as offenders. It is also worth noting that 28 percent of the 191 articles (n=53) did not identify offenders by gender.

Denton (2010) was also interested in identifying the country of origin of human trafficking offenders who were discussed in newspaper articles. Although he could not identify the country of origin for offenders in 75 of the articles, 116 (61 percent) of the 191 articles discussed the offenders' country of origin. In 49 (42 percent) of the articles the reporter identified offenders as being from the United States. Additionally, 25 (22 percent) articles identified offenders as being from Southeast Asia and Asia (not including Russia), while 22 (19 percent) articles identified offenders as originating from Eastern and Western Europe. Lastly, 20 (17 percent) articles identified offenders as coming from the Middle East.

Similarly to offenders, the victims' country of origin could not be identified in some of the newspaper articles. The victims' country of origin was discussed in 130 (68 percent) of the 191 articles. However, 51 (39 percent) articles identified victims as originating from Southeast Asia and Asia, while 35 (27 percent) articles discussed victims as originating from North America. A total of 15 (12 percent) articles identified victims as being from Africa, and another 15 (12 percent) articles identified victims as coming from Central America. Lastly, 14 (10 percent) articles discussed victims originating from the Middle East.

In summary, Denton's (2010) study revealed similar findings to other research on the portrayal of human trafficking in the media. Specifically, these newspapers portrayed a typical dyad of victim vs. villain, with females commonly portrayed as the innocent victim and males as the evil offender. Denton (2010) concluded "that trafficked males are rarely given the victim-status attention in the media that their female and child counterparts receive" (Denton 2010:21). As discussed previously, this means that the picture of human trafficking in the media is not accurate, and may lead to policies that focus primarily on women and children, neglecting the differential needs of male and adult victims. In fact, Denton concludes that anti-trafficking organizations have utilized newspapers to portray this image to the public, and that it has resulted in policies that largely meet the needs of women and children, resulting in fewer policies benefiting male victims.

In summary, this chapter has provided an overview of the current literature on human trafficking and the media. While Gulati's 2008 study examined what claims-

makers were present in the newspapers, his study does not examine how these claims-makers are portraying victims and offenders as my current study seeks to. Additionally, only a few studies have examined the characteristics of victims and offenders such as their gender and age (Bjork 2007; Denton 2010; Wilson and Dalton 2008). However, my study differed as I further analyzed whether victims or offenders are heard most frequently in the newspapers by examining the quotes they have in the paper. Additionally, my study further analyzed whether claims-makers are presenting the victims and offenders in a positive or negative light. Lastly, my thesis was the only study on human trafficking and newspapers that examined how victims and offenders are portrayed by examining the photo placement of them. Next, I will discuss the methodology utilized in this study on human trafficking and the newspapers.

CHAPTER 4

METHODOLOGY

This chapter presents a review of the methods used to study how victims of human trafficking are portrayed in newspapers compared to offenders. First, I will review the importance of analyzing the portrayal of human trafficking in newspapers. Then, I will review sources from which the data were collected and provide a justification for these sources. I will also discuss the codebooks that I created including a rationale of why the variables were chosen. Finally, I discuss my 13 hypotheses.

As established earlier, newspapers present distorted images of crime (Beard and Payne 2005; Menifield, et al. 2001; Oliver and Armstrong 1998; Rhineberger-Dunn et al. 2008; Surette 2011; Websdale and Alvarez 1998), and these inaccurate images affect our attitudes toward victims and offenders. Accurate or not, people will treat victims and offenders according to the perceptions they garner from these images. They may also influence policy changes that are not effective, because they are based on inaccurate information about the plight of victims and the characteristics of offenders. For this reason, it is essential to understand how newspapers portray victims and offenders since the media is a primary source for knowledge of this particular crime (Logan 2007).

Data Collection

I collected data from three different regional newspapers: *The New York Times, The Los Angeles Times*, and *The Florida Times-Union.* These newspapers were chosen for various reasons. *The New York Times* was chosen specifically because Gulati (2008) used this paper in his research on how newspapers frame human trafficking. *The New York Times* is also the third largest newspaper in the nation, and has a large circulation of readers both nationally and internationally (Audit Bureau Circulation 2011; Tena 2010). *The Los Angeles Times* was chosen because the paper has a high volume of readers and is the fourth largest newspaper in the nation (Audit Bureau Circulation 2011). *The Florida Times-Union* was chosen because it is one of the top one hundred newspapers in the United States, and the paper has the twenty-fourth highest circulation rate (Audit Bureau Circulation 2011).

While these newspapers have high circulation of readers, New York, California, and Florida are also the top destinations for human trafficking to occur (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services 2010). These states have access to international highways, international corporations, growing population of immigrations, and access to bordering countries that make these states prime destinations to traffic victims to and from (Florida University Center for Advancement of Human Rights 2003). These three newspapers are more likely to cover international stories, which allows for a greater depth of cases to be analyzed (Center for Women Policy Studies 2006; Florida National Organization for Women 2011). Florida is also known to have one of the highest numbers of human

trafficking incidences, according to their law enforcement personnel (Florida National Organization for Women 2011). Moreover, New York and California have the highest rate of federal prosecutions of cases under the Trafficking Victims Protection ACT (TVPA) (Clawson et al. 2008). Most importantly, utilizing newspapers from three different regions in the United States allows for a break in the geographic spread.

The data were collected from articles appearing in these three newspapers between 2005 and 2012. The Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA), passed in 2000, allowed for prosecution of human trafficking as a federal crime. Following the passage of the TVPA in 2000 and its reauthorization in 2003, the year 2005 was chosen as the beginning of the study period. The TVPA reauthorization year is avoided because of the possible increase of human trafficking reporting as a result of the heightened awareness of the act during its reauthorization year (Farrell and Fahy 2009). The year 2005 allowed enough time for possible fluctuation of reporting on human trafficking due to the reauthorization years. The year 2012 is the ending date of my research in order to fully include 8 years. Lexis Nexis provided the articles for the three newspapers; this database has been extensively used in crime and media research.

<u>Content Analysis</u>

I used both quantitative and qualitative content analyses. A content analysis is a useful method to analyze data in newspapers as it allows for a general overview of the data (Weber 1990). I conducted a quantitative content analysis to collect countable data

(e.g., if victims were illegal or legal citizens). I also used a qualitative content analysis, which allows for a more in-depth analysis of the data (Weber 1990), for example, to examine who the claims-makers were that made statements in the newspapers about the victims and offenders. Two separate codebooks were created to ensure that the data could be collected using a quantitative approach by numbering items on the codebook, and utilizing a qualitative approach by collecting quotes and statements from the victims, offenders, and agencies present during the incidents in the newspapers.

To identify articles for inclusion in this study, I utilized Gulati's (2008) approach in obtaining articles from Lexis Nexis, as this search engine allows for an extensive search on human trafficking. Lexis Nexis allows for researchers to limit the years that articles can be selected from in the search engine, ensuring that only specific years would be collected in this study. It is an ideal search engine to collect articles online for content analyses as it is less time consuming compared to searching through old newspapers, and it provides a sample of the media's content (Weber 1990). Prior studies on human trafficking and newspapers have also utilized a content analysis to collect data by retrieving articles from an online database (Denton 2010; Farrell and Fahy 2009; Gulati 2008; Wilson and Dalton 2008).

Based on Wilson and Dalton (2008) and Gulati's (2008) content analyses on human trafficking and newspapers, I conducted the search in Lexis Nexis using the following key words:(a) human trafficking, (b) modern day slavery, (c) sex trafficking, and (d) sex slaves. Phrases such as human traffic and sex traffic, sex rings, and human

slavery were omitted from the search criteria as the same results appeared in the previous search.

As the focus of this study was to examine how victims and offenders of human trafficking are portrayed in newspapers, only articles that focused on a specific incident of human trafficking were included in the analysis. Some articles were eliminated from the study because they only discussed the topic of human trafficking rather than a specific case (e.g., new policies on human trafficking and law enforcement responses to this crime). Cases of human smuggling were eliminated from the study. While these crimes are similar they are not the same. "Most notably, smuggling is a crime against a country's borders, whereas human trafficking is a crime against a person" (Polaris Project 2013:66). Human smuggling "requires illegal border crossing, while human trafficking involves labor services or sex acts through deception, force or fraud" (Polaris Project 2013:76).

Duplicate articles were also eliminated in this newspaper analysis on human trafficking. Because several searches were completed, each with different search terms, some articles were captured in multiple searches. Only one of the articles was included in the analysis. Additionally, articles that merely focused on agencies that deal with human trafficking issues (e.g., Polaris Project, Hope, and local non-profits) and did not discuss offenders or victims were not included. Editorials were not utilized as they are not actual cases of human trafficking and may not contain factual information. As a result, 76 cases

were analyzed from *The New York Times,* 23 cases from *The Los Angeles Times,* and 24

cases from *The Florida Times-Union* throughout the six year time frame.

Quantitative Codebook

The quantitative codebook consisted of 80 variables. The variables were chosen in

order to answer the research question and the 13 hypotheses. Some of these variables

included the type of trafficking, gender, age, legal status, location, and photo placement

of the victims and offenders. In the following paragraphs, I will discuss the essential

variables in the codebook, how they were coded, and how they were defined.

Variables in the codebook included the geographic location of the cases. The

variables were coded in the codebook as follows: 1. local, 2. national, 3. international and

99. undetermined. Cases were defined as undetermined if the article did not reveal

enough information (e.g., occurred somewhere outside of New York). Local cases meant

the incident happened in the same city or state as the paper was located in; and the

victims /offenders were from the same city or state as the article was published in.

National cases were defined as occurring in a state outside of the newspaper's

geographical location. National cases also included articles where the victims were

trafficked to another state, or the victims were from a different state than the article's

publication. International cases were defined as happening in a country outside of the

United States. International cases also included articles where the victims were

transported to another country or they were from outside of the United States.

The trafficking type was coded as follows: 1. sex trafficking, 2. domestic/labor

trafficking, 3. both (sex trafficking and domestic/labor trafficking), 4. other, and 99. data

that could not be determined or were missing from the article. Sex trafficking was defined as obtaining a person for the purpose of using them for a sex act, through means of force, fraud, or coercion (Farrell and Fahy 2009). The Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000 (TVPA) defines labor trafficking as: "the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud, or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery" (U.S. Department of Health and Human Services: 2010).

The next section in the codebook examined the coverage of human trafficking, meaning how many cases occurred in each year from 2005 to 2012 within the three newspapers combined. I coded the data by running Excel, and it added the number of cases for each year in all the three newspapers combined, and the variables were totaled together. Utilizing Excel I was able to compare each year within the three newspapers to determine if they had an increase of coverage on human trafficking or if some of the newspapers stayed the same or decreased their coverage.

The next category in the codebook was demographics of the victims and offenders. Data were collected on gender, age, and legal status of the victims and offenders of human trafficking. Gender was coded in the analysis as follows: 1. male, 2. female, 3. both, and 99. undetermined or missing information. Age of the victims and offenders in my analysis were open ended items because these demographics varied significantly.

Gender was based on if the victims and offenders had a gender-specific name. However, if they did not have a gender-specific name the variable was coded as

undetermined; unless the article used gender specific language. Gender-specific language was defined similar to Wilson and Dalton's definition, specifically by using words such as he/she/him/her or girl/boy. For example, "juvenile victims of sex trafficking whom we identified were nearly all girls between 10 and 17 years old" (Wilson and Dalton 2008:301).

Following Bjork (2007), juveniles in the analysis were defined as males or females under the age of 18. Simply specific with the federal standard, adults were defined as males or females over the age of 18 years old. If the article did not discuss the victim's age then the variable was coded as undetermined. Some articles in the newspapers that discussed victims' and offenders' previous cases. Because this study was concerned with current cases (those occurring between 2005 and 2012), victims' and offenders' ages were coded as to their age at the time of their victimization, rather than their "current" age.

The next section in the codebook included the total number of male and female victims, male and female adult victims, male and female juvenile victims. The total number of victims in my analysis were open-ended items because these demographics varied significantly. Offenders' ages were collected the same way in the analysis. These variables were open-ended items in the codebook because the numbers would vary significantly. If the newspaper did not identify the victim's or offender's age, but stated the victim/offender was a female juvenile, the variable was still be coded in the analysis.

I also made note of the victims' and offenders' legal status. This was coded as follows: 1. illegal, 2, legal, 3. other and 99. undetermined and missing data. The victims

and offenders were coded as undetermined if the newspapers did not state that they were illegal or legal citizens, or state they were from a different region than the location of the case.

The last section of the quantitative codebook dealt with photo placement of the victims and the offenders. These variables were coded as follows: 1 for Yes, meaning there was a photo of the victim(s) and 99. No, there is not a photo. Lexis Nexis does not have photos through the search engine, so Google News Archive was utilized to retrieve photos of the victims and offenders.

Qualitative Codebook

The purpose of the qualitative portion of the codebook was to analyze quotes about the victims and offenders. Only a few content analyses on human trafficking and newspapers have taken a multi-method approach in collecting data (Bjork 2007; Farrell and Fahy 2009; Wilson and Dalton 2008). Positive and negative quotes about the victims and offenders allowed for further analysis if particular victims and offenders were being portrayed in a positive or negative manner. Positive quotes are defined as discussing the victims or offenders positive characteristics. Negative quotes are defined as placing blame on the victim or offender or discussing negative qualities about them. Victims' and offenders' legal status and gender were additionally noted. From these variables, patterns can be noted if particular victims or offenders were being portrayed in a negative or a positive manner, such as female victims receiving most of the positive statements from the claims-makers. My research also focused on who portrayed the victims and offenders in a positive or negative light. I also made these items open-ended so I could identify the

various types of claims-makers that may appear in these newspaper articles (e.g. government officials, non-profits organizations, Federal Bureau of Investigations).

Quotes were also included in the codebook if the article discussed previous human trafficking cases, and agencies such as law enforcement were making statements about the offenders or victims from previous cases. This type of approach allowed for more quotes to be collected and analyzed, resulting in a more comprehensive study.

Quotes from the victims and offenders were also collected. These items could determine who was given more voice in the newspapers, the victims or offenders. Previous literature has found that certain victims and offenders are voiceless in the media for particular crimes (Chermak 1995). However, if the quote was not specifically from the victims or offenders, but someone else re-stating an original statement, this was coded separately as being re-stated. If the newspaper stories discussed more than one case, all of them would be included in the analysis, unless the case had been retrieved already. For example, if the newspaper article discussed human trafficking cases that happened a couple of days ago and then discussed a similar case that happened a few years ago, both would be used. This allowed for a more in-depth analysis of human trafficking cases appearing in the study newspapers.

As stated previously, the purpose of this study was to examine how victims are portrayed in the newspapers compared to offenders. This thesis sought to answer 13 hypotheses. In the following pages there will be a discussion of why each hypothesis was chosen and how previous studies support it.

Hypotheses

Hypothesis 1

There will be an increase in coverage of human trafficking articles from 2005 to 2012. Prior to 2000, newspaper stories rarely discussed human trafficking (Bjork 2007; Farrell and Fahy 2009). Previous studies on human trafficking and newspapers have revealed that in recent years reporting on human trafficking has increased

Hypothesis 2

There will be more newspaper coverage on sex trafficking than domestic/labor trafficking. Previous studies on human trafficking and newspapers revealed that in recent years, papers have focused on stories about sex trafficking, rarely discussing labor/domestic trafficking (Farrell and Fahy 2009; Weitzer 2007). Newspapers are a business, and their goal is to make a profit; newspapers' stories about sex trafficking are more likely to sell as they appear interesting and out of the normal (Surette 2011; Weitzer 2007).

Hypothesis 3

There will be an increase of coverage of local cases compared to international and national cases of human trafficking. Claims-makers often chose to cover local stories because people have a closer attachment if an incident happens close to home, and they are likely to take interest in these stories (Chermak 1995). Reporters also frequently cover local cases because of time and money constraints (Chermak 1995).

Hypothesis 4

Articles in the newspapers will focus more on female victims compared to male victims. Previous studies on human trafficking and newspapers have largely focused on covering stories with female victims while male victims are hardly mentioned (Denton 2010; Wilson and Dalton 2008). Claims-makers have largely consisted of special interest groups such as Women's Rights Organizations who chose to report about specific victims because their goal is to have the public view the crime in a particular manner so they will advocate for the same policy changes (Farrell and Fahy 2009; Weitzer 2007).

Hypothesis 5

Female juvenile victims will receive more newspaper coverage compared to adult female victims in the three newspapers. Prior studies on human trafficking and newspapers have revealed that female juvenile victims were the focus in the newspapers (Denton 2010; Wilson and Dalton 2008). Claims-makers often cover stories about the "ideal victim," who is young and vulnerable. The public is likely to gain more empathy for these victims (Greer 2007; Loseke 2003).

Hypothesis 6

Male juvenile victims will receive more newspaper coverage compared to adult male victims in the three newspapers. Prior human trafficking and newspaper studies have revealed that juvenile males are more frequently mentioned in newspapers compared to adult male victims (Denton 2010; Weitzer 2007; Wilson and Dalton 2008). Claims-makers often focus on discussing young victims in newspapers because juvenile victims are more vulnerable compared to adult victims (Greer 2007). Therefore, the

public is more likely to be sympathetic towards these victims, resulting in them taking interest in the story (Denton 2010; Weitzer 2007; Wilson and Dalton 2008).

Hypothesis 7

Victims will have more quotes in the three newspapers compared to offenders. Human trafficking has been socially constructed as a crime where the victim is the focus in newspapers (Denton 2010; Farrell and Fahy 2009; Gulati 2008; Weitzer 2007; Wilson and Dalton 2008). Crime and media literature reveals that victims who are considered the "ideal victim" are frequently quoted in newspapers so people are more empathetic towards them (Greer 2007).

Hypothesis 8

Claims-makers cited in the three study newspapers will mostly consist of non-profit organizations and federal agencies. Previous research has revealed that dominant claims-makers of human trafficking consisted of non-profit organizations such as women's organizations and federal government agencies (Gulati 2008; Weitzer 2007). Also if the newspapers frequently cover international stories, they are more likely to interview federal agencies about human trafficking.

Hypothesis 9

Victims will be portrayed in a more positive manner in the newspapers compared to offenders. Human trafficking and newspapers have largely focused on female victims in newspapers and have rarely discussed male victims (Denton 2010; Farrell and Fahy 2009; Weitzer 2007; Wilson and Dalton 2008). Crime and media literature also reveals

stories that sell are the ones where the offender is purely evil and the victim is purely innocent because these stories are more frightening and deemed newsworthy (Greer 2007).

Hypothesis 10

Female victims are more likely to be framed in a positive manner compared to male victims. Crime and media literature has revealed that not all victims receive the same amount of coverage in newspapers (Chermak 1995; Greer 2007; Sacco 1995). Media coverage focuses on covering stories of victims who are portrayed as "the ideal victim" who are elderly women, middle class, and young children. Whereas men and people of lower social classes are less likely to receive positive newspaper coverage (Greer 2007). "In this sense, exists a hierarchy of victimization, both reflected and reinforced in media and official discourses" (Greer 2007:22). Ideal victims are likely to capture the attention of media because people are more likely to feel empathy towards them because they are more vulnerable (Greer 2007). Prior human trafficking and newspapers research revealed that most of the victims presented in newspapers consisted of women and children, rarely presenting men as victims (Denton 2010; Weitzer 2007; Wilson and Dalton 2008).

Hypothesis 11

The further away victims are geographically from the United States, the more likely claims-makers will portray them in a negative manner. Bjork's (2007) study on human trafficking and newspapers in Thailand supported this hypothesis. He found the further away victims were from Thailand, claims-makers portrayed them in a negative

manner, while victims who lived closer to Thailand were portrayed more in a positive

manner. Crime and media literature supports this hypothesis as the media creates

distorted images of victims that are rooted in assumptions, myths and stereotypes

(Altheide 1997; Boulahanis and Heltsley 2004; Chiricos et al. 1997; Gerbner and Gross

1976; Goidel, Freeman, and Procopio 2006; Greer 2007; Heath and Petraitis 1987). For

example, the "ideal victims" of crimes such as stalking mostly consists of females that

are considered next door neighbors (Greer 2007). Minority victims are frequently

demonized in newspapers and are portrayed as "evil" and do not achieve the "ideal victim

status" (Greer 2007).

 Hypothesis 12

Offenders from outside the United States are more likely to be portrayed in a

negative manner. According to Greer (2007), minorities from another country are

frequently demonized in the media and labeled the "criminal other." Whether the

criminals are pimps, rioters, muggers, drug dealers or gang members, the association

between race and crime becomes reinforced within the media (Greer 2007). Claims-

makers want to make the story, so they chose to vilify offenders from outside countries

because people have less of attachment to people outside the United States (Loseke

2003).

Hypothesis 13

Articles are more likely to have photos of victims than offenders. Visuals are

essential in newspapers as they enhance public interest and help to communicate the

message of how victims and offenders are portrayed (Greer 2007). For example, a

photograph of family members crying over the loss of their child who was murdered creates a lasting image in the reader's mind, and by adding photos, it creates empathy for them (Chermak 1995). "Visuals have always played an important part in the manufacture of crime news, but today it has become a universally defining characteristic" (Hall 1973:10). Newspapers with images of victims make it more newsworthy because people are able to visualize the crime better (Chermak 1995). Photos of victims in newspapers help the readers to become familiarized with them, while words along cannot (Sontage 2004). Journalists believe that if readers can see the victims it adds potential, and life to them, while words to describe a person mean nothing without the image (Chermak 1995). At the same time, "they serve indirectly to highlight the monstrosity and evil of the offender and to endorse the extent to which this monstrosity should inform justice" (D'Cruze, Pegg, and Walklate 2006: 22).

In summary, this chapter has provided an overview of the methods that were used in this analysis. The hypotheses were outlined and a discussion was provided that showed how these hypotheses related to the existing literature, to better understand how the victims and offenders in the newspapers would be analyzed. The following section will discuss the results of this study on how newspapers' portray victims and offenders in these three newspapers. Lastly, the 13 hypotheses will be answered in the following chapter.

CHAPTER 5

FINDINGS

The purpose of this study was to examine the social construction of offenders compared to victims of human trafficking in *The New York Times, The Los Angeles Times* and *The Florida Times-Union* over an eight year time frame between 2005 and 2012. This thesis tested thirteen hypotheses using an in-depth content analysis of newspaper articles about victims and offenders of human trafficking. In this chapter, I discuss the findings as they relate to each of the following hypotheses.

Hypothesis 1 predicted that there would be an increase in the coverage of human trafficking cases from 2005 to 2012. In total, 123 human trafficking cases were presented between 2005 and 2012 in *The New York Times, The Los Angeles Times* and *The Florida Times-Union*. In the three newspapers the numbers were fairly flat from 2005 to 2009. For example, 2 percent (3) of the 123 cases occurred in 2005. In 2006, 8 (7 percent) of the human trafficking cases in this study were discussed in that year. In 2007, there was a similar level of human trafficking cases. Seven (6 percent) of the total number of cases occurred that year. There was seemingly a minor decrease of coverage of human trafficking cases in 2008, but again it remained steady, with 5 cases (4 percent) occurring in that year. In 2009, human trafficking cases were reported more frequently compared to previous years, 9 (7 percent) occurring within that year.

However, in 2010, the number of human trafficking cases in these newspapers nearly doubled, with 21 (17 percent) occurring in that year. In 2011, 27 (22 percent) of the human trafficking cases were discussed that year. In 2012, human trafficking cases received an extensive amount of newspaper coverage. In 2012, human trafficking cases appeared 43 times (35 percent of all stories between 2005 to 2012). The increase of coverage in 2012 may be the result of recent changes in state laws related to the prosecution of human trafficking (U.S. Department of State 2012). So, while there is consistently minimal coverage of this issue in the first 5 years of my study sample, there was a substantial increase in coverage from 2010 to 2012. Table 1 provides the yearly coverage of human trafficking cases from 2005 to 2012 in the three study newspapers. The table provides data on whether the coverage of human trafficking has increased or decreased over recent years.

Table 1: Coverage of Human Trafficking Cases and Study Years

YEAR	TOTAL
2005	3 (2%)
2006	8 (7%)
2007	7 (6%)
2008	5 (4%)
2009	9 (7%)
2010	21 (17%)
2011	27 (22%)
2012	43 (35%)
TOTAL	123 (100%)

Hypothesis 2 proposes that there will be more newspaper coverage of sex trafficking than domestic/labor trafficking. The aggregate data support this hypothesis. While there were a grand total of 123 newspaper articles about human trafficking in these outlets between 2005 and 2012, eight of these articles were not specific enough to determine the particular type of trafficking being addressed. Hence, the focus here is on the 115 articles where the subject matter could be coded as being about sex trafficking, domestic/labor trafficking, or both. Of these 115 determined cases, sex trafficking is covered in 94 (82 percent) of the articles, while domestic/labor trafficking is the topic in only 16 (14 percent) of the cases. Five (4 percent) of the articles discussed both sex trafficking and domestic/labor issues. Table 2 provides the aggregated results of the type of human trafficking cases that the three newspapers covered between 2005 and 2012. The "Both" column means that the newspaper discussed sex trafficking and domestic/labor trafficking in the same article.

Table 2: Coverage of Types Human Trafficking Cases and Study Years

All Newspapers	Total
Sex	94 (82%)
Domestic/Labor	16 (14%)
Both	5 (4%)
Total	115 (100%)

Hypothesis 3 predicted there would be more newspaper coverage of local cases

than national or international cases. Local is defined as the case happening in the same

city as the newspaper is located in. This hypothesis was not supported and there were

more international cases compared to local and national cases in the three newspapers.

However, the findings revealed that there were more local cases compared to national

cases in the three newspapers. Of the 123 cases presented across the three newspapers,

58 (47 percent) of the cases were international. Local cases in the newspapers were

represented in 42 (34 percent) of the cases. National cases only represented 23 (19

percent) of the cases in the three study newspapers. Table 3 provides the summation of

the total number of local, national, and international human trafficking stories that *The

New York Times*, *The Los Angeles Times* and *The Florida Times-Union* presented

between 2005 and 2012.

Table 3: Coverage of Local, National, and International Human Trafficking Cases of the
Three Study Newspapers

Newspapers	Total
International	58 (47%)
National	23 (19%)
Local	42 (34%)

The findings support hypothesis 4, with female victims receiving a majority of the newspaper coverage on this topic. Of the 123 articles on human trafficking in the three newspapers, the sex of the victim/s could be determined in 102 of the articles (83 percent). Additionally, 5 out of 102 (5 percent) articles discussed both males and females being trafficked together. A total of 955 male or female victims were presented in these 102 newspaper articles. Of the 955 victims, 848 (89 percent) were female victims, and 107 (11 percent) were male victims. Table 4 presents the number and percentage of female and male victims presented in the three newspapers, and reflects the findings related to Hypothesis 4, which states that: Cases in the newspapers will focus more on female victims compared to male victims

Table 4: Total Number and Percent of Presented Victims by Sex in the
Three Study Newspapers

All Newspapers	Total
Female Victims	848 (89%)
Male Victims	107 (11%)
Total	955 (100%)

The findings support Hypothesis 5, with a significantly higher number of female juvenile victims presented in these newspapers compared to adult female victims. Adult female victims were present in 36 of the 123 cases (29 percent). In addition, 208 of the 848 (25 percent) female victims were adult female victims. However, the most prevalent victims in the newspapers were female juvenile victims. Of the 848 total victims where age and sex are identified, 640 (75 percent) were female juvenile victims. Female juvenile victims were discussed in 61 (50 percent) of the 123 cases. Adult female victims were present in merely 10 (4 percent) of the 123 cases. The average age of the female victims throughout the 123 cases was 16 years old, even though one case had a significant number (n=100) of adult female victims. Lastly 263 victims' gender or age could not be identified and cases were coded as missing. Table 5 reflects the number of female juveniles and adult female victims presented across *The New York Times*, *The Los Angeles Times* and *The Florida Times-Union*.

Table 5: Number and Percent of Juvenile Female Victims Compared to Adult Female Victims in the Three Study Newspapers

Victims	Total
Adult Female Victims	208 (25%)
Juvenile Female Victims	640 (75 %)
Total	848 (100%)

These findings do not support Hypothesis 6, juvenile male victims did not receive more newspaper coverage compared to adult male victims. However, while there were a higher number of adult males present in the newspapers compared to juvenile males there were still more cases with juvenile males. The reason there were more adult males compared to juvenile males is because the two cases with adult males had a higher number of victims in the cases. The cases with adult males discussed labor trafficking cases with several adult males being trafficked together. On the other hand, the cases with juvenile males only discussed one or two males in the cases. Male victims were present in 12 (8 percent) of the 123 cases in *The New York Times*, *The Los Angeles Times,* and *The Florida Times-Union.* Male victims accounted for 107 of the 955 (11 percent) total victims in the three newspapers. There were a significant number of adult male victims in the cases, but this was due to 95 (89 percent) adults being discussed in two cases and no other victims. Likewise, there were only a total of 12 (11 percent) male juvenile victims of the 117 male victims. Again, 263 victims' gender or age could not be identified. Table 6 presents the number of male juvenile victims and adult male victims in the three study newspapers.

Table 6: Number and Percent of Adult Male Victims Compared to Juvenile Male Victims in the Three Study Newspapers

Victims	Total
Adult Male Victims	95 (89%)
Juvenile Male Victims	12 (11 %)
Total	107 (100%)

On the other hand, juvenile male victims were present in more cases compared to adult male victims. In the newspapers 10 (80 percent) of the 12 cases discussed male juveniles. Adult males were only discussed in 2 (20 percent) of the 12 cases with male victims. Therefore, male juveniles still received more widespread coverage compared to adult male victims regardless that there were more adult male victims total. Again, 263 victims' gender or age could not be identified.

The following section analyzed quotes from the claimers-makers of agencies that were present in the cases and examined if victims or offenders are heard more frequently in the newspapers. This was done by counting the number of indirect statements and quotes they made in each case. This allowed for a more in-depth analysis of victims and offenders and whether or not they are portrayed positively or negatively.

Table 7: Number of Cases and Percent of Adult Male Victims Compared to Juvenile Male Victims in the Three Study Newspapers

Victims (Cases)	Total
Adult Male Victims	2 (20%)
Juvenile Male Victims	10 (80 %)
Total	12 (100%)

These findings support Hypothesis 7, victims had more quotes and indirect statements in the newspapers compared to offenders. Indirect statements meaning that someone else re-stated the victims or offenders original statement. In the three newspapers there were a total of 300 quotes and indirect statements from victims and offenders. Victims had 239 of the 300 (80 percent) quotes and indirect statements in the three newspapers. Offenders only had 61 (20 percent) quotes and indirect statements of the 300 in the newspapers. Victims also had more direct statements in the three study newspapers. Of the 187 direct quotes that were made by victims and offenders, victims made 151 (81 percent) of them. On the other hand, offenders only had 36 (19 percent) of 187 direct quotes. Of the 113 indirect statements in the newspapers, victims were re-stated in the newspaper by someone else 88 (78 percent) times. On the other hand, offenders were only re-stated in the newspapers 25 (22 percent) times. This is similar results to Denton (2010) and Wilson and Dalton (2008). Table 8 reflects the total number of quotes and indirect statements from victims and offenders in *The New York Times, The Los Angeles Times and The Florida Times-Union*. In the next paragraphs I discuss the findings from the analysis of the victims and offenders of human trafficking from the claims-makers.

Table 8: Quotes from Victims and Offenders in the Three Study Newspapers

Newspaper	All Newspapers		Total
	Direct Quotes	Indirect Quotes	Quotes and Indirect
Victims	151 (81%)	88 (78%)	239 (80%)
Offenders	36 (19%)	25 (22%)	61 (20%)
Total	187 (100%)	113 (100%)	300 (100%)

The combined finding across all three newspapers does not fully support hypothesis 9, that non-profit organizations and federal agencies would be the dominant claims-makers in newspaper cases on human trafficking. The findings also revealed that law enforcement offers were also dominant claims-makers in the three newspapers. There were 347 claims-makers present within the 123 cases in T*he New York Times, The Los Angeles Times*, and *The Florida Times-Union*. Some of the cases had several claims-makers that were present. Of the 123 cases in *The New York Times*, *The Los Angeles Times*, and *The Florida Times*, federal agencies were the most present, with these groups being cited 120 (35 percent) times in the cases. Police were the second highest quoted group in this analysis. A total of 77 (22 percent) of the claims-makers were police officers either at the local or state level. Non-profit organizations were cited 47 (13 percent) times in the cases. Foreign government agencies were present 35 (10 percent) times in the cases.

Local government entities represented 26 (7 percent) of the claims-makers that were present in the cases. Professors/teachers were only cited 18 (5 percent) times in the cases. Next, 13 (4 percent) claims-makers consisted of United Corporations. United Corporations are businesses who trade within the United States. Lastly, across the three newspapers 12 (3 percent) claims-makers were health care professionals. Table 9 below reflects the number of claims-makers that were present in *The New York, Times, The Los Angeles Times, and The Florida Times-Union* from 2005 to 2012.

Table 9: Claims-Makers Present in All Three Newspapers

	TOTAL
Agencies	
Federal Agencies	120 (35%)
Police Officers	77 (22%)
Non-Profit Organizations	46 (13%)
Foreign Government Agencies	35 (10%)
Local Government	26 (7%)
Professors/Teachers	18 (5%)
United Corporations	13 (4%)
Health Care Professionals	12 (3%)
Total	347 (100%)

The findings support Hypothesis 9, that victims were portrayed in a more positive manner compared to offenders. Victims received 81 quotes in the three newspapers, 39 (67 percent) were positive quotes from claims-makers, and 42 (34 percent) were negative quotes. On the other hand, offenders received 100 quotes from claims-makers in the three newspapers. Offenders received 19 (33 percent) positive quotes, and 81 (66 percent) negative quotes. These findings supported previous studies on human trafficking and newspapers that portrayed victims in a more positive light compared to offenders (Denton 2010; Wilson and Dalton 2008). Table 10 reflects the number of positive and negative statements about the victims and offenders across the three newspapers.

Table 10: Positive and Negative Quotes about Victims and Offenders in
All Three Newspapers

Total	All Newspapers		Total
	Positive Quotes	Negative Quotes	
Victims	39 (67%)	42 (34%)	81 (100%)
Offenders	19 (33%)	81 (66%)	100 (100%)
Total	58 (100%)	123 (100%)	181 (100%)

The findings did not support hypothesis 10, and revealed that newspapers portrayed male victims in a more positive manner than female victims. However, there were only a small number of cases that discussed male victims. Male victim received 12 quotes from claims-makers in the newspapers, 6 quotes (50 percent) were positive, and 6 (50 percent) were negative quotes. On the other hand, female victims received 70 quotes from claims-makers, 33 (47 percent) were positive quotes, 37 (53 percent) were negative quotes. These findings do not support previous studies on human trafficking and newspapers (Denton 2010; Wilson and Dalton 2008). However, previous studies have not analyzed quotes from victims and offenders in newspapers. Table 11 shows the number of positive and negative quotes about male and female victims in all three newspapers.

Table 11: Quotes and Statements about Female Victims and Male Victims from
Claims-Makers in the Three Study Newspapers

Newspapers	All Newspapers		
	Positive Quotes	Negative Quotes	Total
Female Victims	33 (47%)	37 (53%)	70 (100%)
Male Victims	6 (50%)	6 (50%)	12 (100%)

The findings support Hypothesis 11, victims who were from the United States were portrayed in a positive manner compared to victims farther away from the United States. Victims from the United received 32 quotes from claims-makers, and 31 (97 percent) were positive quotes, and only 1 (3 percent) was a negative quote. On the other hand, foreign victims received 48 quotes in the newspapers from claims-makers, 8 (16 percent) were positive quotes, and 41 (84 percent) were negative quotes. These findings are similar to previous studies on human trafficking and newspapers that portrayed foreign victims in negative manner compared to legal victims (Bjork 2007; Denton 2010; Wilson and Dalton 2008). Table 12 reflects the number of positive and negative statements made by claims-makers about illegal and legal victims.

Table 12: Victims' Portrayal in the Three Study Newspapers

All Newspapers	Positive Quotes	Negative Quotes	Total
U.S Victims	31 (97%)	1 (3%)	32 (100%)
Foreign Victims	8 (16%)	41 (84%)	49 (100%)

Hypothesis 12 was supported, offenders from other countries were presented in a more negative light compared to offenders from the United States in the three newspapers. Offenders from the United States received 48 quotes in the newspapers from claims-makers, 17 (35 percent) of them were positive quotes, and 31 (65 percent) were negative quotes. On the other hand, claims-makers made 51 quotes in the newspapers about foreign offenders, 2 (4 percent) were positive, and 50 (96 percent) were negative quotes. Denton's (2010) study also supported my findings and found that foreign offenders were portrayed in a more negative manner compared to offenders from the United States. Table 13 shows how foreign offenders were portrayed in the newspapers compared to how offenders from the United States were portrayed.

Table 13: Offenders' Portrayal in All Three Newspapers

All Newspapers	Positive Quotes	Negative Quotes	Total
U.S Offenders	17 (35%)	31 (65%)	48 (100%)
Foreign Offenders	2 (4%)	50 (96%)	52 (100%)

These results support Hypothesis 13, and reveal that victims are a greater focus in human trafficking-related pictures across the three newspapers in this study. In *The New York Times*, *The Los Angeles Times*, and the *Florida Times-Union* there were 70 photos of offenders or victims. Of the 70 photos presented in the three newspapers, victims appeared in 49 (70 percent) of the photos. On the other hand, offenders appeared in 21 (30 percent) of the 70 photos in these newspapers. Clearly there were more photos of victims across these newspapers as compared to photos of offenders. Table 14 presents the number of times the three newspapers provided a photo of the victims and offenders.

Table 14: Number and Percentage of Photos of Victims and Offenders in the Three Study Newspapers

All Newspapers	Photo Present
Victims	49 (70%)
Offenders	21 (30%)
Total	70 (100%)

CHAPTER 6

DISCUSSION

The purpose of this research was to compare the social construction of victims and offenders of human trafficking. Editors of newspapers decide what criminal events to report and what stories to cover. As a result it is these editors' decisions that bring stories to the public's attention and shape people's perceptions of crime, offenders, and victims. However, there is question about whether what is presented in newspapers is inaccurate. Claims-makers' stories create a "new" reality of the crime, and these images and stories can influence the public's behaviors, such as people being more fearful of certain victims or offenders (Chermak 1995). Claims-makers also can be social activists, people who are experts in a particular field, but this research specifically focuses on how editors of newspapers portray victims and offenders. Claims-makers decide what victims and offenders to focus on, therefore, socially constructing victims and offenders in a positive or negative manner. For example, claims-makers might focus on the extreme cases of victims of sex trafficking. This kind of coverage causes the public to have a distorted image of crime, offenders, and victims, and alters people's perceptions about how we can best fix the problem.

Coverage of human trafficking in this study was shown to increase over the years from 2010 to 2012, in *The New York Times*, *The Los Angeles Times*, and *The Florida-Times Union,* while remaining steady from 2005 to 2009. Comparing earlier studies on

human trafficking and the media with more current studies reveals that the media have portrayed human trafficking as an increasing problem (Farrell and Fahy 2009; Weitzer 2007). Prior to 2000, stories of human trafficking were almost non-existent in the media. This increase in media stories is correlated with the re-authorization of the Trafficking Victims Protection Act (TVPA) in 2008. Through their description and images, newspapers create a story of crime that influences public behavior. In the case of human trafficking, people have become more fearful of offenders (Farrell and Fahy 2009). Not only did the coverage of human trafficking increase from 2010 to 2012 in this study, but there was also an increase in coverage of local, international, and sex trafficking cases during this same time frame.

My data showed that the increases in newspaper stories have heightened awareness of human trafficking, but that does not mean that the rate of human trafficking has increased from 2010 to 2012. It might be possible that claims-makers of newspapers have focused on stories about local, international and sex trafficking cases during this time frame because these stories are more newsworthy. The public is more likely to take interest in these stories if they happen close to home, as people feel they have a stronger attachment to these stories (Best 1995; Greer 2007). News reporters frequently report on local cases because it is easier for them to acquire stories compared to reporting on national or international cases, as they have less access to the stories further away due to time and money constraints (Chermak 1998). However, claims-makers also frequently report on international cases because these stories appear more frightening when the offender is from another country (Chermak 1995). However, this does not necessarily

mean that the amount of human trafficking is increasing, but instead that reporters have chosen to cover these stories more than they had before.

It is imperative that readers know who the claims-makers are that present the information on human trafficking in newspapers because not all of them are necessarily experts in the field. If claims-makers are not experts and wrongly describe the prevalence of sex trafficking then a result could be a "moral panic" (Weitzer 2007). In this case, people will be misled about the crime, the victims, and the offenders. The media is an essential source for the public to learn about human trafficking (Logan 2007). If people want a more accurate picture of human trafficking, they need to be aware of the expertise of the claims-makers and pay more attention to the academic experts on human trafficking. In this way the readers will get a more accurate picture of the prevalence of human trafficking.

Claims-makers have focused on covering stories about sex trafficking while ignoring other types of human trafficking like domestic or labor trafficking (Denton 2010; Weitzer 2007; Wilson and Dalton 2008). My research revealed that stories about labor trafficking and domestic trafficking were almost non-existent. Sex trafficking was the focus in all three newspapers I studied. My findings were similar to previous studies on human trafficking and newspapers (Denton 2010; Weitzer 2007; Wilson and Dalton 2008). In *The Florida Times-Union* claims-makers only discussed stories about sex trafficking. Other types of human trafficking were not discussed. Sex trafficking in the three newspapers increased from 2010 to 2012, while there were very few stories about labor and domestic trafficking, and those stories did not increase in coverage. This could

cause the public to view human trafficking as an increasing problem making them more concerned about this crime, regardless of whether human trafficking is more prevalent today than in the past. Claims-makers have captured the attention of the media, portraying human trafficking as an increasing social problem.

Bjork's 2007 study on human trafficking found that claims-makers mostly covered cases on labor trafficking while rarely presenting stories on sex trafficking (Bjork 2007). These results vary from mine probably because he did his research in Thailand, and different countries may focus on different social problems. Bjork's study revealed that newspaper stories on human trafficking cited academics frequently while in my research in the United States, academics were rarely cited, and were only cited in 5 percent of the cases. I contend that the prevalence of sex trafficking compared to labor trafficking is correlated with social activists drawing attention to human trafficking by focusing on extreme cases. This results in the construction of the public's perception of human trafficking that is based on how certain claims-makers have presented it. For example, the public might view victims of sex trafficking as more deserving of receiving assistance compared to victims of labor trafficking, regardless of the treatment of both sets of victims. This can result in victims not receiving the help they need, because of the newspapers portrayal of the crime.

Weitzer's (2007) study on human trafficking and the media supported my research, stories of sex trafficking were more prevalent compared to other types of human trafficking. Weitzer (2007) found that stories about sex trafficking were more pervasive compared to labor trafficking because people are already familiar with prostitution which

shares similarities with sex trafficking. Weitzer (2007) argued that when people are familiar with a crime, claims-makers frequently link a similar crime with it because they can use some of the same arguments. The techniques are called piggybacking and domain expansion. Labor trafficking is less frequently linked to other crimes, and therefore is less frequently mentioned by claims-makers (Best 1995; Chermak 1995). Claims-makers' main role is to sell newspapers, not necessarily to report factual information (Best 1995; Chermak 1995). As a result, claims-makers will sell stories about sex trafficking compared to labor trafficking because readers are more likely to buy newspapers that feature sex trafficking.

My research revealed that the dominant claims-makers in these newspapers consisted of federal agencies, non-profit organizations, and police agencies. Academics were rarely cited in these newspapers' stories. Gulati's (2008) study on human trafficking supported my research; he found that academics were rarely cited in the newspapers. It is still important to emphasize that not all claims-makers are attempting to distort images of human trafficking, but their focus is to sell newspapers that capture the public's attention and sometimes important information is left out. For example, they might discuss women as victims so policies will better assist these victims. Rather, the focus of academic research on human trafficking is to better inform the public and policy makers so that social policy can be effective.

My research revealed that claims-makers in these newspaper stories mostly discussed females, while male victims were rarely mentioned. Juveniles were also the focus in the newspapers. More cases focused on female juvenile victims compared to

male juvenile victims in the newspapers. My research supported previous research on human trafficking and newspapers where stories focused on juvenile females (Denton 2010; Weitzer 2007; Wilson and Dalton 2008). Crime and media literature reveal that victims and offenders appear more youthful in newspapers than they are in reality, causing the public to have more sympathy for youthful victims (Chermak 1995; Sacco 1995) Stories with young female victims also draw more attention in the news because these victims seem more vulnerable and innocent (Best 1995; Chermak 1995).

Victims as opposed to offenders were interviewed more frequently in the three newspapers included in my study. This is similar to other studies on human trafficking where victims were more frequently mentioned compared to offenders (Denton 2010; Wilson and Dalton 2008). Women victims were quoted more frequently than male victims, who were rarely quoted in the paper. Only a few stories discussed male victims. On the other hand, my research revealed that male offenders had more quotes compared to female offenders, and only a few stories mentioned female offenders. This potentially might also cause the public to view other crimes as more frightening and serious if the public does not question what is presented in the media. Policies that are created might be more harmful than helpful if particular victims are being ignored due the newspapers' portrayal of them.

When compared to offenders, victims received more positive statements and fewer negative statements in the newspapers included in my research. Non-profit organizations usually focus on specific victims, and a significant number of stories in my research revealed that these organizations made many more positive statements about

victims. Similarly, social activists groups may have a clear agenda to gain support for their cause. For example, the social activist group MADD constructed the social problem of drunk driving as individual choice rather than constructing it as a disease, in order to draw attention to victims. Consequently, what social activists present about the victims can be misleading if they are quoted exclusively.

My research revealed that claims-makers used motivational framing in these newspaper stories on human trafficking. Motivational framing is when claims-makers try to persuade audience members through logic and emotions. For example, in some of the stories, claims-makers portrayed the victims in a positive manner by discussing the victims' positive characteristics. This can cause people to get a distorted image of those involved in human trafficking when claims-makers use this kind of framing. Frequently claims-makers' goals are for the public to view victims in a positive light so readers feel a greater attachment to these victims (Best 1995; Loseke 2003). However, this can cause people to negatively view offenders because people have gained sympathy for the victims. This can be problematic because the audiences will focus on the individual offenders as the cause of the problem and deflect blame from other issues such as mental health or lack of family support contributing to their offenses. If claims-makers are only presenting a particular image of victims as being exclusively victimized and offenders as exclusively offenders, the public will be unaware of the complexity of the situation (Loseke 2003; Greer 2007). Offenders may need assistance to help them because they may have been victims as well. Similarly, victims can also be offenders. Distorting

images of human trafficking in newspapers by claims-makers as experts can lead the public to misinterpret the crime.

Previous studies also support my conclusion that victims were portrayed in an exclusively negative light the further they lived from the United States (Denton 2010; Wilson and Dalton 2008). This probably occurs because readers will have a closer attachment to victims when they are from somewhere close, as the public can better relate to them. However, I argue that this does not mean that victims from the United States are more deserving of the victim status compared to victims from outside of the United States. Instead how non-profits and social activists are quoted can affect the public's perception of crime, its victims, and offenders.

My study revealed that female victims were portrayed in negative manner compared to male victims. However, female victims were the focus in the three newspapers. It is possible that female victims were portrayed in a more negative light compared to male victims because the newspapers rarely discussed male victims. Male victims were only discussed in 11 percent of the cases compared to female victims being discussed in 89 percent of the cases. Previous research on human trafficking and newspapers has not collected quotes about victims and offenders. Instead, previous human trafficking and newspaper literature have revealed that female victims have been the focus in the newspapers (Denton 2010; Wilson and Dalton 2008).

Denton's (2010) study on stories about human trafficking in newspapers had similar findings to my research. His research revealed that most of the offenders who were arrested were from a country outside of the United States. His study also found that

most of the stories in the newspapers that focused on female offenders who were arrested were from outside of the United States as well. This disrupts the notion that because women are from the United States they will not be offenders. Newspapers chose to cover stories that appear newsworthy, and likely to attract public attention. According to Denton (2010) the public is more likely to view the crime as frightening and a serious matter when the offenders are from another country.

Images also matter in the public's perception of crime (Chermak 1995). My analysis revealed that most of the photos in these newspapers consisted of victims and not offenders. Newspapers are concerned with producing appealing images in papers because photos can include detailed images using sparse space that otherwise would have taken several paragraphs to explain. For example, in using photos of offenders carrying weapons or family members crying over a loss of a child, journalists hope that the public will feel the pain. This can increase hatred towards the offender. Then the story will carry greater news value as a result of these dramatic images (Greer 2007). "And in the words of one journalist, 'If the public can see … a victim, it adds something. There is nothing to a name. When you see a picture, you see the life, the potential" (Chermak, 1995: 104). For example…"in missing persons and murder cases, victim photographs are rendered more poignant still by the understanding that those featured may be, or already are, dead, but they present an idealized personification of innocence and loss" (D'Cruze et al. 2006:22). The public is likely to be more sympathetic towards victims and more hostile towards the offenders when most of the images presented in the newspapers consist of victims. This means that the public is not receiving the full story of an incident even

through photos in newspapers, and that the public is receiving a distorted perception through the claims-makers words and the newspapers' images.

This research emphasized the power that the media have on distorting crime through framing, utilizing particular images and words in newspapers. This can lead to a misconception of crime if readers are not cautious of who the claims-makers are that present the crime and what their objective is. Claims-makers in my research mainly consisted of three groups: federal agencies, non-profits such as women's organizations, and police agencies. Greer (2007) argues that not all victims receive equal attention in the media. Instead, the media focus on covering stories with the "ideal victim" who are vulnerable, young, innocent, and defenseless (Greer 2007). Newspapers frequently neglect to present stories that do not portray this "ideal victim" image (Greer 2007).

Minorities are rarely perceived as the "ideal victim" in newspaper stories (Denton 2010; Greer 2007; Weitzer 2007). For example, newspapers seldom feature stories about victims who are homeless or have drug problems and have been victimized (Greer 2007). However, when newspaper stories present victims who have not acquired the status of the "ideal victim," claims-makers will frequently vilify these victims by discussing their background instead of their victimization (Greer 2007). Newspaper stories instead focus on discussing positive characteristics about the "ideal victim," portraying them in a positive light (Greer 2007; Weitzer 2007). Rarely do stories in newspapers focus on victims who are low social economic status (Greer 2007). Instead the public perceives these stories as less newsworthy because people are not as fearful of crime when it happens further away (Best 1990; Best 1995; Loseke 2003). Likewise, people are less

likely to buy these newspapers. Newspapers who present only a particular type of victim and a particular type of offender can be problematic. This can cause the public to have false perception of victims and offenders, such that they act or look only very specific ways. Policies will rarely benefit all victims if readers are not aware that the media frames victims and offenders in ways that are skewed (Best 1995; Chermak 1995).

If the portrayal of victims and offenders is skewed because of their gender, age, race and social status then all victims will not receive the help they need. As a result, these victims might be unlikely to report their victimization due to their past experiences of feeling ignored or re-victimized. It might be that these victims could also become offenders because of not receiving the help they need with their past experiences and trauma. On the other hand, if offenders are portrayed as purely evil in newspapers, the public may not recognize that these offenders have been victims as well. Instead, these offenders will not receive the help they need and will likely re-offend. If the public recognizes offenders as victims they might receive the help they need and become part of society.

<div align="center">Limitations</div>

This analysis is not representative of the nation. I chose *The New York Times*, *The Los Angeles Times*, and *The Florida Times-Union* because of their high volume of readers and because they are in states that have a high percentage of human trafficking (Audit Bureau Circulation 2011) Even though the study is not representative, it still represents a relatively accurate portrayal of trends in representation of victims and offenders involved in human trafficking.

The first limitation is a result of the inclusion of some types of information in newspaper stories. These inclusions caused me to be unable to determine the gender and legal status of victims and offenders. In this case of gender 15.4 percent of the stories I collected did not mention the gender of the victims or offenders. Similarly, the victim legal status was not mentioned in 67 percent of the stories. Offenders' legal status was not mentioned in 33 percent. Because of this kind of missing data I had to exclude data from my analysis.

Finally, my research design cannot address audience's interpretations of the newspaper stories. It is focused on the social construction of victims and offenders of human trafficking. Though I argue that these stories influence how people construct their images and understanding of human trafficking, I cannot get at their actual interpretations. My design was only aimed at an analysis of the newspaper stories, but I hope that the data analysis can help influence public policy.

<center>Future Research</center>

My research can be used as the basic for future research. First, that can address some of the limitations of my research design. Future research could focus on covering more newspapers in different regions in the United States. My study analyzed newspapers that covered a wide range of regions included areas where human trafficking is most prominent in New York, California, and Florida (Polaris Project 2013). However, future research could include other regions such as Arizona and Texas. There are a high number of cases of human trafficking in states that border Mexico, and provide easier access for offenders to force victims to and from the United States (Polaris Project 2013).

In this way, research on human trafficking would be more representative. Only three newspapers were used in my research, even though these newspapers are prominent newspapers in New York, California and Florida, and have high revenue of readers (Audit Bureau of Circulation 2011). They are not representative of the whole country. Future studies could expand to include newspapers such as the *USA Today, Dallas News, San Francisco News, Arizona Republic, and the Miami Herald.* As a result, this could expand the number of cases that could be analyzed in future studies.

Future research could also analyze human trafficking cases in newspapers over a longer period of time. A longitudinal study could determine if claims-makers are continuing to portray victims and offenders in a positive or negative manner. Analyzing newspapers over ten years, for example, could help researchers to determine how the social construction of human trafficking is influenced by genders, country of origin, and age groups of victims and offenders. This will bring to light if different types of claims-makers that are cited in the newspapers portray the victims and offender differently over time. This will allow researchers to analyze what changes in society may be correlated with an increase in number of stories about human trafficking, as well as change in who the claims-makers are.

<div align="center">Policy Implications</div>

This thesis on human trafficking and newspapers revealed that claims-makers in the study were predominantly federal agencies, non-profit organizations such as women's organizations, and police agencies. Claims-makers frequently use the media to further their claims, and influence the public understanding of human trafficking. If the main

claims-makers about human trafficking are federal agencies, non-profit organizations, and police agencies it is essential that spokespersons for these agencies are experts in the field of human trafficking, otherwise public understanding will be based on information that is not accurate. It is essential that these organizations have adequate training on human trafficking and how to handle the victims and offenders of these crimes. Consequently, not only would this benefit the victims, but the public would get a more accurate picture of the victims and offenders. Because the media are a primary source of people's knowledge about human trafficking and because these claims-makers are frequently reporting on the crime, it is imperative that readers pay attention to the credentials of the claims-makers (Logan 2007).

Newspapers have mostly focused on sex trafficking and have vilified offenders in the newspapers, while portraying victims in a more favorable light (Denton 2010; Weitzer 2007; Wilson and Dalton 2008). However, I presume that victims are more likely to become offenders if they do not receive the help they need. As a result, more policies should be implemented to help offenders with rehabilitation. Victims who have been sexually assaulted are 62 percent more likely to become predators then people who have not been victims (Ahlmeyer et al. 2000:1) According The Texas Human Trafficking Prevention Task Force Report (2012:12), a study found that 72 percent of the men arrested for sex trafficking were pimps, of that 72 percent, 52 percent of them were sold as sex slaves prior to them being arrested. Another incident in Houston, Texas arrested 601 males for sex trafficking and 360 of them were prior victims of sex trafficking (The Texas Human Trafficking Prevention Task Force Report 2012: 12). Therefore, it is

essential that more programs focus on helping offenders because the media frequently

vilifies offenders and many of them have been prior victims (Greer 2007).

REFERENCES

Adoni, Mane. 1984. "Media and the Social Construction of Reality: Toward an Integration of Theory and Research." *Communication Research* 11(3):323-340.

Ahlmeyer, Sam, Patricia Heil, Bill McKee and Katharine English. 2000. "The impact of polygraph on admissions of victims and offenses in adult sexual offenders." *Sex Abuse Journal* (2):123-38.

Altheide, David. 1997. "The News Media, the Problem Frame, and the Production of Fear." *Sociological Quarterly* 38:647-668.

Audit Bureau of Circulation. 2011. Retrieved December 2, 2013 from http://www.auditbureau.org

Bailey, Frank and Donna Hale. 1998. *Popular Culture, Crime, and Justice*. Albany, NY: West Wadsworth Publishing Company.

Barak, Gregg. 1993. "Media, Crime and Justice: A Case of Constitutive Criminology." *Humanity and Society* 17(3):272-296.

Beard, Holly and Brian Payne. 2005. "The Portrayal of Elder Abuse in the National Media." *American Journal of Criminal Justice* 29 (2): 1-29.

Beckett, Katherine and Theodore Sasson. 2000. *The Politics of Injustice: Crime and Punishment in America*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Pine Forge

Berger, Peter and Thomas Luckman. 1967. *The Social Construction of Reality*. Middlesex, England: Penguin Books.

Berger, Peter and Thomas Luckman. 1996. *The Social Construction of Reality*. Middlesex, England: Anchor Books.

Best, Joel. 1989. *Images of Issues: Typifying Contemporary Social Problems*. 1st edition. Hawthorne, NY: Aldine de Gruyter.

Best, Joel. 1990. *Threatened Children: Rhetoric and Concern about Child-Victims*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago.

Best, Joel. 1995. *Images of Issues: Typifying Contemporary Social Problems*. 2nd edition. Hawthorne, NY: Aldine de Gruyter.

Best, Joel. 1999. *Random Violence: How We Talk About New Crimes and New Victims*. Berkley, CA: University of California Press.

Bjork, Jenny. 2007. "*Analysis of Sub-regional Media Coverage of Human Trafficking and Migration*: 2004-2007." Paper presented for the ILO MeKong sub-regional project to combat trafficking in women and children, July 27, Bangkok.

Boulahanis, John and Martha J. Heltsley. 2004. "Perceived Fears: The Reporting Patterns of Juvenile Homicide in Chicago Newspapers." *Criminal Justice Policy Review* 15(2)132-160.

Center for Women Policy Studies. 2006. *U.S. Policy Advocacy to Combat Trafficking Clearinghouse.* Retrieved September 30, 2010 from http://www.centerwomenpolicy.org/

Chermak, Steven M. 1995. *Victims in the News: Crime and the American News Media.* Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Chermak, Steven. 1998. "Predicting Crime Story Salience: The Effects of Crime, Victim, and Defendant Characteristics." *Journal of Criminal Justice* 26(1)61-70.

Chiricos, Ted, Sarah Eschholz and Marc Gertz. 1997. "Crime, News and Fear of Crime: Towards an Identification of Audience Effects." *Social Problems* 44:342-357.

Clawson, Heather, Nicole Dutch, Sarah Lopez and Sarah Tiapula. 2008. "*Prosecuting Human Trafficking Cases: Lessons Learned and Promising Practices.*" Retrieved September 30, 2010 from http://www.ojp.usdj.gov.nij/

D'Cruze, Shani, Samantha Pegg and Sandra Walklate. 2006. *Murder: Social and Historical Approaches to Understanding Murder and Murderers.* Portland, OR Willan Publishing.

Denton, Erin. 2010. "International News Coverage of Human Trafficking Arrests and Prosecutions: A Content Analysis." *Women & Criminal Justice* 20:10-26.

Farrell, Amy and Stephanie Fahy. 2009 "The Problem of Human Trafficking in the U.S.: Public Frames and Policy Responses." *Journal of Criminal Justice* 37:617-626.

Florida National Organization for Women. 2011. Retrieved October 1, 2012 from http://www.now.org/chapters/fl.html

Florida University Center for Advancement of Human Rights. 2003. Retrieved May, 5, 2011 from http://www.popcenter.org/problems/trafficked_women

Gerbner, George and Larry Gross. 1976. "Living With Television: The Violence Profile." *Journal of Communication Spring*: 173-199.

Goidel, Robert K., Craig M. Freeman and Steven T. Procopio. 2006. "The Impact of Television Viewing on Perceptions of Juvenile Crime." *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media* 50(1):119-139.

Greer, Chris. 2007. *News Media, Victims and Crime.* Los Angeles, CA: Sage Publications Ltd.

Gulati, Jeff. 2008. *"Media Representation of Human Trafficking in Three Liberal Media Systems."* Paper presented at the annual meeting of the APSA 2008 Annual Meeting, Hynes Convention Center, Boston, Massachusetts. Retrieved September 30, 2010 http://www.allacademic.com/meta/p280352_index.html

Hall, Stuart. 1973. *The Manufacture of News: Deviance, Social Problems and the Mass Media*. London, UK: Constable.

Heath, Linda and John Petraitis. 1987. "Television Viewing and Fear of Crime: Where Is the Mean World?" *Sage Journal* 8(1&2):97-123.

Holstein, James A. and Gale Miller. 1993. *Reconsidering Social Constructionism Debates in Social Problems Theory.* New Brunswick, NJ: Aldine Transactions.

Johnston, Hank and John A. Noakes. 2005. *Frames of Protest: Social Movements and the Framing Perspective.* New York, NY: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, Inc.

Logan, T.K. 2007. *Human Trafficking in Kentucky*. Lexington, KY: University of Kentucky.

Loseke, Donileen R. 2003. *Thinking about Social Problems.* New Brunswick, NJ: Aldine Transactions.

Menifield, Charles E., Winfield H. Rose, John Homa and Anita Brewer Cunningham. 2001. "The Media's Portrayal of Urban and Rural School Violence: A Preliminary Analysis. "Deviant Behavior: *An Interdisciplinary Journal* 22:447-464.

Oliver, Marybeth and Blake Armstrong. 1998. "The color of crime: perception of Caucasians and African Americans involvement in crime." In Cavender, Gray and Fishman (eds.) *Entertaining Crime: Television Reality Programs*. New York: Aldine de Gruyter.

Polaris Project. 2013. *Human Trafficking*. Retrieved November, 5 2013 from http://www.polarisproject.org

Potter, Gary and Victor E. Kappeler. 2006. *Constructing Crime: Perspectives on Making News and Social Problems*. Long Grove, IL: Waveland Press.

Rhineberger-Dunn, Gayle M., Nicole E. Rader and Kevin D. Williams. 2008. "Constructing Juvenile Delinquency Through Crime Drama: An Analysis of Law & Order." *Journal of Criminal Justice and Popular Culture* 15(1):94-115.

Sacco, Vincent. 1995. "Media Constructions of Crime". Pp. 141-154 in *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*. Oakland, CA: Sage Publications.

Snow, David and Robert Benford. 1998. "Ideology, Frame Resonance, and Participant Mobilization." *International Social Movements*. 1:197-218.

Snow, David and Robert Benford. 2000. "Framing Processes and Social Movements: An Overview and Assessment." *Annual Review of Sociology* 26:611-639.

Sontage, S. 2004. *What have we done?* Cambridge, UK: Guardian Publications.

Spector, Malcolm and John Kitsuse. 1973. "*Social problems*: A Re-Formulation." Social Problems 21:146-159.

Spector, Malcolm and John I. Kitsuse. 2001. *Constructing Social Problems*. New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers.

Surette, Ray. 2011. *Media, Crime and Criminal Justice: Images, Realities and Policies*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth.

Tena, Maria. 2010. "Modern-Day Slavery in U.S.-Mexican Territory: Human Trafficking at the Border." *Border Brief*. San Diego, CA: University of San Diego Press.

The Texas Human Trafficking Prevention Task Force Report. 2012. Attorney General. Retrieved September 1, 2014 from https://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov

Tuchman, George. 1978. "*Making News: A Study in the Construction of Reality*." New York: Free Press.

U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. 2010. *Responding to Human Trafficking of Children*. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services Publication. Retrieved December 5, 2012 from https://www.childrenwelfare.gov

U.S. Department of State. 2012. *Trafficking in Persons Report 2009*. U.S. Department of State Publication 11407. Retrieved September 30, 2012 from http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/123357.pdf

Watson, Neil, Donovan Corti and JP Clarkson. 2002. "Filthy or fashionable? Young people's perceptions of smoking in the media." *Health Educ. Res. Journal* 18 (5): 554-567.

Weber, Robert. 1990. *Basic Content Analysis*. Iowa City, IA: Sage Publications

Websdale, Neil and Alexander Alvarez. 1998. "Forensic Journalism as Patriarchal Ideology." Pp. 123-141 in *Popular Culture, Crime and Justice*. Albany, NY: West Wadsworth Publishing Company.

Weitzer, Ronald. 2007. "The Social Construction of Sex Trafficking: Ideology and Institutionalization of a Moral Crusade." *Politics & Society* 35(3):447-475.

Wilson, Jeremy and Erin Dalton. 2008. "Human Trafficking in the Heartland: Variation in Law Enforcement Awareness and Response." *Journal of Contemporary Criminal Justice* 24(3):296-313.

APPENDIX A

VICTIMS AND OFFENDERS OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING IN
THE NEWSPAPERS QUANTITATIVE CODEBOOK

Newspaper: Circle the following:

1. *The New York Times*   2. *The Los Angeles Times*   3. *The Florida-Times Union*
Title of Article:

Author: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. Associated Press

2. Wire Reports

3. Staff Reporter

4. Other:

Date of publication of article:

Article appears in: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. New York City

2. New York State

3.Los Angeles

4. California State

5.Jacksonville

6.State of Florida

7.Another State

8.Another Country

99. Missing/Other

Newspaper appears in Section:
1. Metro
2. Editorial
3. Nation
99. Missing/Other_____

Case in the article is: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. Local

2. National

3. International

99. Missing/Other_____

Originality: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. Initial article   2. Follow up article

If the article is a follow up article, how many stories have been issued previously?___

Page placement of the victims

Is there a photo of the victims? 1. Yes   99. No/Missing

Page placement of the offenders

Is there a photo of the offenders? 1. Yes   99. No/Missing

Type of trafficking discussed in the article: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. Sex Trade

2. Domestic/Labor Trade

3. Both Sex and Domestic/Labor Trade

4. Other_____

99. Missing/Undetermined

Demographics of victims

1. Male   2.Female   99. Missing/Undetermined

Total number of male victims:_____

Total number of female victims:_____

Total number of male juveniles:_____

Total number of female juveniles:_____

Total number of adult male victims:_____

Total number of adult female victims:_____

Total number of female victims that age could not be determined:_____

Total number of male victims that age could not be determined:_____

Total number of victims that age could not be determined:_____

Victim's legal Status

Victim 1 legal status: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. Illegal

2. Legal

99. Missing/Undetermined

3. Other_____

Victim 2 legal status: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. Illegal

2. Legal

99. Missing/Undetermined

3. Other_____

Victim 3 legal status: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. Illegal

2. Legal

99. Missing/Undetermined

3. Other_____

Victim 4 legal status: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. Illegal

2. Legal

99. Missing/Undetermined

3. Other_____

Victim 5 legal status: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. Illegal

2. Legal

99. Missing/Undetermined

3. Other_____

Demographics of offenders

1. Male   2.Female   99. Missing/Undetermined

Total number of male offenders:_____

Total number of female offenders:_____

Total number of male offenders:_____

Total number of female offenders:_____

Total number of adult male offenders:_____

Total number of adult female offenders:_____

Total number of female offenders that age could not be determined:_____

Total number of male offenders that age could not be determined:_____

Total number of offenders that age could not be determined:_____

Offender's legal Status

Offender 1 legal status: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. Illegal

2. Legal

99. Missing/Undetermined

3. Other_____

Offender 2 legal status: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. Illegal

2. Legal

99. Missing/Undetermined

3. Other_____

Offender 3 legal status: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. Illegal

2. Legal

99. Missing/Undetermined

3. Other_____

Offender 4 legal status: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. Illegal

2. Legal

99. Missing/Undetermined

3. Other_____

Offender 5 legal status: (Circle the most appropriate word)

1. Illegal

2. Legal

99. Missing/Undetermined

3. Other_____

APPENDIX B

VICTIMS AND OFFENDERS OF HUMAN TRAFFICKING
IN THE NEWSPAPERS QUALITATIVE CODEBOOK

Positive attributions about the victims

Comments made about the victim: What agency or person made this statement/discussion

about the victim? (If more than one person indicate who is presenting which statement or

discussion _____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Quotes from the victims:

Victim 1:_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Victim 2:_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Victim 3:_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Victim 4:_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Victims 5:_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Which victim made the statement? (If more than one victim is presenting information

indicate who is presenting what) _____

_____

_____

_____

Any other relevant information:_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Offender Section

Relevant comments made about the offender (including both positive and negative

attributes) What agency or person made this statement/discussion about the offender? (If

more than one person indicate who is presenting which statement/discussion)_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Quotes from the offenders

Offender 1:_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Offender 2:_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Offender 3:_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Offender 4:_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Offender 5:_____

_____

_____

_____

_____

Additional information about the offender's outcome of the case:_____

_____

_____

_____

_____