Predictors of Racial Prejudice: A Meta-Analysis of the Influence of Religion and Political Orientation

Kristin Broussard
University of Northern Iowa
Predictors of Racial Prejudice: A Meta-Analysis of the Influence of Religion and Political Orientation

Kristin A. Broussard
Helen C. Harton
University of Northern Iowa

Presented at the 2015 UNI Graduate Symposium
Social Identities

- Social identities can promote: (Tajfel & Turner, 1979)
  - Ingroup cohesion
  - Social exclusion
  - Intergroup competition

- Important social identities for Americans
  - 83.1% of Americans religiously affiliated (Pew Forum on Religion & Public Life, 2008)
  - 36% of Americans identify with highly partisan politics (Pew Research Center, 2014)
Religion and Racial Prejudice

- Constructs related to racial prejudice:
  - Religious fundamentalism (Hill, Terrell, Cohen, & Nagoshi, 2010; Kirkpatrick, 1993; Laythe et al., 2002)
  - Religious ethnocentrism (Altemeyer, 2004; Rowatt, Franklin, & Cotton, 2005)
  - Religious identity (Jacobson, 1998; Perkins, 1992)
  - Religiosity (Johnson et al., 2012)

  - Generalized from religious exclusivity
  - Moral inferiority of outgroups
Political Orientation and Racial Prejudice

- Constructs related to racial prejudice:
  - Social Dominance Orientation (Jost & Thompson, 2000; Kteily, Sidanius, & Levin, 2011; Quist & Resendez, 2002)
  - Right-Wing Authoritarianism (Cohrs, Maes, Moschner, & Kielmann, 2007; von Collani & Grumm, 2009; Whitley, 1999)

- Ideological Motivations
  - Protestant Work Ethic (PWE; Weber, 1958)
  - System Justification (Jost & Banaji, 1994)
  - Justification-Suppression Model (JSM; Crandall & Eshleman, 2003)
What is meta-analysis?

- Statistical procedure to assess the magnitude of an effect across multiple studies

Benefits:
- Better estimate than single study
- Quantify research
- Replication
- Resolves some NHST issues
Effect size:

- “objective and standardized measure of the magnitude of an observed effect” (Field, 2005)
- Independent from sample size
- Main types of effect size for meta-analysis:
  - Pearson’s correlation coefficient $r$
- Calculate effect sizes across studies
Purpose

- **Prior meta-analyses:**
  - Have not compared religion & political orientation effects
  - Tend to have moderate-to-large publication bias

- **Current meta-analysis:**
  - Religious constructs and Political Orientation constructs
  - Assess region of country & data year
  - Inclusion of unpublished data
  - Estimate intercorrelation of religion and political orientation

- **Research Question:**
  - Which group identity (i.e., political orientation or religion) has the greatest effect on racial prejudice?
Method: Inclusion Criteria

- U.S. samples
- Anti-Black prejudice/racism
- Religion:
  - Religious fundamentalism
  - Religious ethnocentrism
  - Religious identity/religiosity
- PO:
  - SDO
  - RWA
  - Political conservatism
  - Political orientation
- Published 1964-2014
- Searches: PsycINFO, Google Scholar, unpublished data requests and databases
Collection Summary

- Total of 446 independent samples; 569 effect sizes
- Methodological Information:
  - Scale/measure
  - Sample sizes
  - Sample population type
  - Location
  - Year of data collection
- Statistical Information:
  - Reliabilities of measures
  - Effect sizes/statistical values
- Interrater agreement = 88.6%
Results: Religion Constructs

- 75 independent samples, 198 effect sizes
  - $T^2 = .43$
- Mean $r = .04$
- Final Model: type of prejudice measure & type of religious construct
  - $T^2 = .006, R^2 = .985 (99\%)$
- Moderators:
  - Year$_{\text{continuous}}$: $R^2 = -.006, T^2 = .44$
  - Year$_{\text{categorical}}$: $R^2 = -.01, T^2 = .44$
  - Region: $R^2 = -.14, T^2 = .50$
Results: Political Orientation Constructs

- 136 independent samples, 371 effect sizes
  - $T^2 = .07$
- Mean $r = .15$
- Final Model: type of prejudice measure & type of PO construct
  - $T^2 = .03, R^2 = .827$ (83%)
- Moderators:
  - $R^2_{\text{continuous}} = -.01$
  - $R^2_{\text{categorical}} = -.007$
  - Region: $R^2 = .535$ (54%)
    - Midwest: $r = .36$
    - West and South: $r = .29$
Difference in effects:

- Religion and Racial Prejudice: \( r = .04 \)
- Political Orientation and Racial Prejudice: \( r = .15 \)
  \( p(\text{two-tailed}) < .001 \)

Including the intercorrelation effects:

- Correlation between Religion and PO: \( r_{xy} = .08 \)
  \( z = .003, p(\text{two-tailed}) = .98 \)
Discussion: Religious Constructs

- Religion not related to anti-Black prejudice
  - Inclusion of RWA or religious orientation
  - Related to other types of prejudice (e.g., anti-gay, religious outgroups)
  - Prior meta-analyses include other countries (McCleary et al., 2011) or other racial targets (Hall et al., 2004; McCleary et al., 2011)
  - Prior meta-analyses have moderate to large publication bias
Discussion: Political Orientation Constructs

- Political orientation constructs consistently correlated with anti-Black prejudice
  - Small effect: indicative of a tendency, not absolute
  - Conservatism ≠ greatly increased racial prejudice

- Possible Explanations
  - Justify opposition to racial policies and welfare (Gilens, 1996; Reyna et al., 2005)
  - Conservatism = resistance to change → conformity, social intolerance, endorsement of racial stereotypes (Hurwitz & Peffley, 1992)
  - System-justifying beliefs (Jost & Hunyady, 2005)
Thank you,
Ariel Aloe

Funding provided by UNI CSBS Thesis Grant